

**MARKET INQUIRY INTO THE  
LAND BASED PUBLIC PASSENGER  
TRANSPORT SECTOR.**

5

[●]

10

---

**THURSDAY 19 JULY**

---

VENUE:

15

**(Kimberly)**

## Contents

	Session 1.....	3
	Session 2.....	37
5	Session 3.....	57
	Session 4.....	79

## Session 1

**CHAIRPERSON:** Morning everyone, welcome to the Competition Commission's Public Passenger Transport Market Inquiry. Today is the 19<sup>th</sup> of July 2018. This is the 14<sup>th</sup> day of the Competition Commission's Public Hearings  
5 in to the Public Passenger Transport Market Sector.

My name is Bukhosibakhe Majenge. I am the Chief Legal Counsel at the Competition Commission, and I am also the Chairperson of the panel. I am joined by 2 panel members. On my right, I am joined by Ms. Nompucuko Nontombana who is the Divisional Manager of the Market Conduct Division of  
10 the Competition Commission and on my left I am joined by Mr. Thulani Mandiriza who is joining the panel in his capacity as the head of the inquiry's technical team. Both Ms Nontombana and Mr Mandiriza are both economists at the Competition Commission. On my extreme right we have Mr. Jabulani Ngobeni and Mr Itumeleng Lesofe who are both from the Competition  
15 Commission; they will be acting as evidence leaders in this hearing. And they together with a team of the Commission's lawyers and economists will be assisting the panel in soliciting evidence for the Inquiry.

Before we begin today's session I would just like to recap the rules that will be applicable to this session.

20 Firstly the sitting of the Inquiry will be open to the public at all times except when the Chairperson rule that part of the proceedings will be closed on the grounds related to confidentiality or for any other reasons deemed justifiable in terms of Competition Act.

All sessions will be recorded and will be transcribed and streamed live on YouTube except for those sessions or parts of the session that will be closed. In order to allow for the proper ventilation of issues, the Chairperson and the panel members, as well as evidence leaders may pose questions to any person making oral submissions or to any witness. The Chairperson will not permit any person, neither personally nor through a legal representative, to question any witness or any person making oral submissions during these proceedings. In the event that any stakeholder has an objection, comment or question in respect of any submission made during these proceedings. That stakeholder must submit such a question, comment or objection to the Inquiry in writing and the Inquiry will attend to such an objection, comment or question as soon as possible at an appropriate time.

Once again I would like to welcome everyone to this hearing here in Kimberley. We will, of course, only conduct a hearing in Kimberley for a day and I do hope that this will provide us with an opportunity to receive as much information as possible in relation to public transport issues in this province.

We will start with a presentation from the Provincial Department of Transport, Safety and Liaisons which is based here in Kimberley. Morning M'am and thank you very much for coming. There should be a piece of paper in front of you. You may take the oath or the affirmation and please switch on the mike as you do so.

**MS OLIVIER:** ...[inaudible]

**CHAIRPERSON:** *Ja*, you may take the oath or the affirmation, but please switch on the mike as you do so.

**MS OLIVIER**: Okay, thank you very much. I, Cornelia Elizabeth Olivier, swear that the evidence that I shall give. Shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth. So, help me God.

**CORNELIA ELIZABETH OLIVIER** (d.s.s.)

5 **CHAIRPERSON**: Thank you very much Ms Olivier. If you could start by, very briefly, just explaining what your current role is in the department and how long have you had your current role and afterwards you can then take us through the presentation and after your presentation the evidence leaders, as well as the panel members will pose questions to you.

10 **MS OLIVIER**: Is it fine if I sit down?

**CHAIRPERSON**: ...[no audible response]

**MS OLIVIER**: Is it fine if I sit down?

**CHAIRPERSON**: Yes, you may present whilst seated.

**MS OLIVIER**: Okay. I am, like I said, I am Connie Olivier. I am part of the  
15 Department of Transport, Safety and Liaison for the last 25 years. I am a Deputy Director Transport, Safety and Compliance. I am currently responsible for three sub-directorates at Transport, Safety and Compliance Section, the License and Permit Section, as well as Infrastructure Operation Section. My responsibilities is license and permits for land based public transport,  
20 compliance issues with the National Land Transport Act, as well as the development of an infrastructure in the province.

**CHAIRPERSON**: Ja, Ms Olivier you may take us through your presentation.

**MS OLIVIER**: Okay. I was asked by the Director to come and assist with the Competition Commission Inquiry into the Land Based Public Passenger Transport Industry. What I have done ... [indistinct] the questions as stipulated in the document. I have grouped it in the presentation and my presentation will

5 just contain a little background about where I come from, but like I explained what we are responsible for. The Directorate is responsible to plan, regulate and facilitate the provision of integrate land transport services through co-ordination with the National Department of Transport as well as planning authorities and private sector in order to enhance the mobility of all

10 communities, particularly those currently with or with limit access.

On slide 5 is just an explanation where transport operation is currently occupying an office in town. Like I said we have five sub-directorates and we are a compliment of 25 staff members. Licenses for transport operations. The scholar transport function is no longer with us and it moved to Department of

15 Education.

So the statement of issue - issues has several questions. So, what I am going to do is I am going to highlight a question and then I will give feedback. If it is fine like that.

Okay. So, the first group of questions is about the long busses service. In the

20 Northern Cape Province, we have six, currently six big bus contracts, Mega Bus, Phumatra Transport and then we have some smaller Van Wyk's Bus Services, Promwit's[?] Namibia and in the Springbok area and smaller like the Santiago Group between Ritchie and Kimberley and also we have a contract between Barkley-West and Kimberley, Rainbow Transport Services. They are

the more smaller bus operation contracts. According to the Act. Now, the first question is about the development of the Integrated Rapid Public Transport Network Systems. In the last 25 years I never think about that the bus rapid transport service will happen here in Northern Cape Province, due to the number of commuters. Maybe due to the base – the area of the Northern Cape Province. The only two, really two or three towns in Northern Cape is Kimberley, Upington and Kuruman currently. So, we did not really take cognisance of a bus rapid transport service. But we have definitely looked at ITPs. So, the National Land Transport Act stipulated that the local sweer of government is responsible for the ITPs, but currently due to capacity problems and a lack of funding, nothing happened on the ground level. So, the province has took it into their responsibility to assist the planning authorities, not with funding but with capacity. So, the planning section in our department will go out and say “I am sorry Emil you work the municipality and assist them with the ITP’s. In the last three years the department has assist 18 planning authorities of the 31 planning authorities, with their ITP’s. So, a National Department also assist with graduate planning and planners, town planners. This year we had three town planners graduate last year to assist with the ITP’s on the ...[indistinct].

The problem also the challenges. Transport, the function of transport it is low, on the lower level municipalities’ responsibilities. It is normal water and sanitation and housing. So, transport is not really important for them and that is why they lack the capacity to develop the transport plans.

On slide 8: what measures can we put in place to ensure that capacity is developed for the successful implementation of the ITP’s The development of the ITP’s is to reprioritise the transport function, is to see the importance of

transport in the province. We are building, currently, just for example: we are currently struggle to build a harbour at – to develop a harbour at Buchu Bay. No one is taking us serious although it is now a Transnet Ports Authority did mention it in their annual report. That we will start with that harbour, but the

5 ITPs is lacking, because of the lack of capacity on ground floor. So, to bring the two together as reprioritised transport at local level or refunction that the province is responsible for ITPs again, like in the past. 2004 with the previous act, the provinces were responsible and we have done in the past or both capacity at local levels and increased funding and funding increased. We tried

10 that several times with PM-tet processes, but funding for ITPs. There is no funding.

On slide 9 we are looking at the main reasons raised by operators during the objection process. I know this is to do with busses. Like I mentioned; we have only six big bus contracts in the provinces. The smaller bus operators are not

15 really like – You cannot Gauteng against Northern Cape. We do not really a lot of applications for bus operations, mostly minibus charter service, maybe a midibus but large bus companies normally operate from - is normally the contracts that we have, the six subsidised contracts. The reasons for objections and that is now overall – the routes are over saturated. The high level of poverty

20 in the province, the unemployment and of course the economy in the Northern Cape it is very low at the moment.

If we go to slide 10. How wide spread is the practice of objecting to new applications? So, what I have done and this one is. Most of our objections, because, like they explain in the previous light. We did not have this large bus

25 operators like Mega Bus is making objections against any applications

Gazetted. Most objections we receive are from taxi associations and planning authorities and it is not a trend in the Northern Cape that Mega Bus will smash all the small bus operators. Most of our small bus operators, currently, operate the learner transport contract, ...[indistinct] is their acronym and they mostly  
5 operate the learner transport contracts and if a contract is - if a small bus operator got a contract from a department normally the Act allows us to issue operating license without the procedure.

Now, on slide 11. In instances where objections were raised by the large operators. How did the PRE finally grant such an operating license and how  
10 long did it take for the PRE to issue such operating license? Our provincial regulator entity actually take each application on its own merit. If there is an objections from a planning authority that prohibit an operation in their area. The PRE will automatically remove that part from the application. If there is more than one route. The PRE will looked at other, but because like I said, because  
15 of the oversaturation on the routes currently with the minibus taxi ...[indistinct] small bus operator's applications - normally they do not apply for operations in the province. If an operating license is approved, according to the Act, you have 60 days to uplift.

Then on slide 12: Is the PRE dealing effectively with objections? This one I  
20 know it is based on the big bus companies, but this one I want to answer on all Objections. All what I know it prohibit new operators to – new operators in the public transport industry. What normally happen is. If you want to, this is now holistic, this is not just for a big bus companies, this is now if anyone apply and there is objection. You must belong to an association, currently, if you want to

come in on a minibus taxi route and they ask – they requested enormous amounts of money up to a R100 000,00 for membership, before you can submit your application for a new application. So, if you did not do it and you want to operate like a non-member the PRE will automatically refuse your application.

5 So, objections, the PRE does not deal with it effectively because firstly it prohibit new entrance, new competition and it keep the public transport industry closed for new entrances.

If we go to slide 13: It is to identify ways that can be utilised to balance the legal provision in the NLTA with potential abuse of the objections progress by larger  
10 operators. So what I will suggest is that to advertise for service when the need arrives and clear indication that in your advertisement it must be a small bus operator, but also, if it is not and a larger company want to apply that they have - must either have a joint venture or sub-contract with a small bus operator to skills transfer and to build capacity in the small bus - for the small bus operator.

15 What are the impediments to the competitive bidding process by government?  
The first one is the big, larger, bus companies; they know how to - they have all attorneys. They know how to complete the bid forms. They know what to fill in. They know what they need. They know their certificates, tax clearances, all those that is necessary. A small bus owner does not have these knowledge,  
20 maybe, and does not have a compliant vehicle. I have an example. We have a route between Kimberley and Ritchie. We have decided to give that tender to SANTACO Co-op. The mini - the SANTACO Group, but they struggled to get busses and they did not have the busses and - but to build capacity they signed a contract with a bus company in Bloemfontein to assist them with busses,  
25 because they could not afford the busses. The 10 busses they need and of

course the bus company in Free State, is a big bus, a larger company and they are winning the whole - they are taking the money, the monthly payment and they get a small amount of that money. So large bus companies and small - what we need to do is government need to build capacity with the small bus owners. We need them to and look at capital to operate for the first - until the first payment. They need finance for insurance, for fuel, for salaries and sometimes the first payment takes up to 30 days after submit or invoice So we need to look at more ways to assist the small bus companies and then that was the 8 questions on the busses. Now we are moving to the minibus taxi type.

10 The first one is: Does the PRE in terms of the new routes act more reactive in such a way that they would obligated to approve operating licenses, because the minibus taxis are operating already. Yes, that is true the PRE – normally what happen they build a hospital. The people start to transport workers there and at the end of the day the PRE is obligated to approve the route, because they are already operating on that route. What need to happen is that transport, public transport planning must be part of all development in the Northern Cape Province. We are – like I said we are building a harbour. Soon they will start to transport people maybe there and at the end of the day the PRE is obligated then to approve that route. We need, first, to advertise the route and ask for people to operate on it and ask for and then approve the routes before a new route is – before a new hospital is open or a new harbour is open.

On slide 16: What would be the optimal process that needs to be followed taxi operators to get new routes allocated to them? This is currently a very silent process, because the National Land Transport Act does not make provision for taxi associations and in the previous Act there was a register – a Registrar at

the offices. Now that function is silent. So, associations apply for other association's routes. So, what happened the association must come to the office. They must bring in the new route. The register was supposed to capture the route, investigate if other associations does not operate on that route and then it will be approved. But then the PRE also look at new development, like Malls, so if workers need to go the Mall, they will look at the safest route to the Mall that does not cross-cut on other associations routes. That was a problem here in the Northern Cape. The court case is still on about two associations that apply on the same route and that court case is from 2012 still, it is the Greenpoint and the CBD Group that operates between the CBD and the Mall. The PRE decided to a approve a new route another association and the court was not in favour of that.

On slide 17: Underlying reason and/or justification for the PRE to issue a moratorium and the effectiveness of the moratoria in deterring entry in to the taxi industry. We have our MEC, Honourable MEC Bartlett called – published a moratorium in 2015/16 to clear a backlog of application of 3 000 plus applications. The backlog was in place for 18 months and during that process we did advertise the outstanding applications. We did have hearings and we did not accept any new applications, during that process, for minibus taxi type or end or transfers. We did accept applications for charter service and learner transport or other services, but not for minibus taxis type. So, the other underlying reasons also is, is the regulated type of applications that are submitted, because we could stipulated which applications we will receive during that process. And what mechanism did the PREs and the municipalities put in place? Now, at the moment in the Northern Cape there is only one -

the province that deals with application in the province and it is our office here in Kimberley. The municipalities are not yet – the function are not yet at the municipal level. It is only at the provincial level here in the province, here in Kimberley. So, the license and permit section, like I said, has only the one  
5 office. The moratorium was published in the National Gazette and it stays there for 18 months and no, like they said, no new applications were received. that does not mean that it assisted with – at that time what happened a lot of illegal operations took place, because when as soon as the min – a mine close, a lot people receive a lot of money and they bought vehicles and they start to  
10 operate illegally.

On slide 19: The underlying causes for the backlogs. The only reason for a backlog, that I can give, is the National Land Transport Act required that all applications must be published in the National Gazette. It cost us approximately R3 000,00 per page. We did – our last Gazette was on 16 July that Gazette cost  
15 us R750 000,00. It is the total amount of money for the whole year for the license and permit section, alone. So, the lack of funding and the request that it must be published in the National Gazette. My suggestion is to remediate the situation is review the Act. Local news papers. Local government offices or only first sending to planning authorities. Only applications that planning authorities  
20 approved publish that applications. Otherwise you publish, planning authorities refuse it and then at the end of the day the PRE also refuse it. The high cost of the Gazette as well as the lack of funding is the reason for the backlog, currently at the Northern Cape PRE.

Then the last slide, slide 20 is the one on the proposed amendments to the  
25 NLTA address the issue of the are restriction between traditional meter taxi

operations and E-hailing and if not – Okay, let me explain. In the Northern Cape Province we have in Kimberley about 4, 5 meter taxi services. We does not have any E-hailing application services at the moment. Mostly the meter, the sedan vehicles, are used by operators as a minibus taxi type, because of  
5 the situate the economic – currently the economic is very low in the province. So, meter taxis are mostly used here in Kimberley between the Casino, the hotels and the airport and the venues where functions are taking place. So, when we approved a sedan, a meter taxi, it is normally a district base. So, we will – all the meter taxis in Kimberley can operate in Francis Baard area and  
10 then the sedan vehicle or the minibus taxi type will operate from taxi rank to a location in a suburb. So, thank you. That is my presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Ms Olivier. Before I hand over the evidence leaders to pose questions to you I will just like you to shed more light on the six bus operators that you mentioned. Are these six bus operators, the  
15 operators who currently contracted by the Provincial Department of Transport to provide subsidised commuter bus services? If you could switch on the mike.

**MS OLIVIER:** What about the six bus contractors?

**CHAIRPERSON:** My question is whether this six bus operators are operators who are currently contracted by the Department to provide subsidised  
20 commuter bus services?

**MS OLIVIER:** *Ja* the six bus contractors are subsidised to – contracted by the Department of Transport, Safety and Liaison. It is from the PM-Tec grant that we have appointed these six bus contractors in three districts of the province.

**CHAIRPERSON:** And which are those districts?

**MS OLIVIER**: Okay, the six bus contractors are Mega Bus in the Kuruman area. It is Rainbow in the Kimberley/Barkley area. Phumatra in the Hartswater area. SANTACO in the Kimberley/Ritchie area. Van Wyk's Bus Services in Springbok area and then also this lady also in the 61, sorry. There is another lady in  
5 Springbok are I cannot remember the name now. It will come to me. Sorry about that I am a little bit nervous.

**CHAIRPERSON**: Mr Lesofe?

**MR LESOFE**: ...[no response]

**CHAIRPERSON**: Mr Ngobeni?

10 **MR NGOBENI**: Thank you Chair and good morning Ms Olivier. I think maybe just to go the slides where start dealing with the minibus taxis. I think you start answering those questions on C1. I think, just to understand, on slide 17, for an example where you start dealing with the question of the moratorium. You indicate the reasons why the moratorium was introduced and then you  
15 indicated the issue that, you know, it was introduced in order to deal with the backlog and all of those things and this is also linked to, I think it is like 19 where you then deal with the causes of the backlog which is one of the issues is the question of funding that you raise in terms of how, you know these applications have to be advertised in the Government Gazette and the fact that  
20 it is very costly. So, maybe just to get the details. Let us first start with the – just to be clear. What are you saying are the reasons for the actual backlog? Are you saying, if I look at slide 19, are you saying that the reasons for the backlog it is because you have been. You know the PRE has been unable to advertise

and therefore none of those applications have - are yet to be adjudicated.  
Without an adjudicative process having been, you know done?

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay, if I understand clearly you ask why the reason for the backlog of that 3 000 plus applications. The reason for the backlog here in the Northern Cape was, I tell about three reasons. First was the gazetting. Gazetting is a pricely. We all know it is very, it is not, it is very expensive to publish and according to the Act you must publish it. Secondly, our reason also is, it is when the – remember the license and permit - the old Board, Operating License Board was supposed to be resolved and the PRE, Provincial Regulator Entity, was supposed to established and there was a lengthily process going on and in that time – we have several MECs and several HODs and so it took a while for us to get the new a PRE and resolve the Operating License Board and the third reason is, I think because of the office. We have in the license and permit section, we have four officials currently. There is a lack of capacity also. We cannot deal with the masses of applications that was there between and ag and smaller reasons is it is removed one office to another and you know in the last 10 years we have mover four, five times. So, there is a lot of reasons why we could not reach the timeframe and that is why it had caused that 3 000 plus backlog.

**MR NGOBENI:** And maybe just to understand how you are currently dealing with the funding issue. Are you now publicising less applications because of the financial issues or how are you dealing with the financial constraints that you have and I will tell you why I am asking. SANTACO, you know in the provinces raised an issue of, you know this backlog and they are saying in their submission to us that it takes three months to three years, you know to get

operating licenses approved. So, the question is given the backlog that you currently have and the financial constraints that you currently have as the Department. What is the strategy? Are you publicising less given the question of funding or how are you dealing with the actual publications in order to move  
5 forward. You know and to clear the backlog.

**MS OLIVIER:** Unfortunately I must tell you we are stuck at the moment, because we have to Gazette. The last time we time gazetted was in 2016. So now we have the Gazette we are ready for publishing, but there is no funding, because of the enormous amount it will cost us now to publish that Gazette  
10 now. We try smaller font. We try to take out of the information, but it does not make a huge difference. So, we are moving now to September to ask for PM-Tec for more funding to see if we cannot get the funding to publish this Gazette and it is true what SANTACO said. It took up to three years now, because of the funding problem and there is no – you all know they cut the budget percent  
15 to 3%, 2% and next year there will be another cut of 1% so there is no way we can deal with the publications, but as I understand with meetings with other provinces. We are all in the same boat at the moment with the expenses of the Government Gazette *daai* expenses that we cannot afford.

**MR NGOBENI:** Just to clarify me. What are the current costs of publication in  
20 the Gazette per application for an operating license.

**MS OLIVIER:** It cost approximately R3 000,00 per page in the Government Gazette. So, last time, like I said, the last Gazette of 2016 cost us R750 000,00 for one Gazette.

**MR NGOBENI:** And just to close off on the point and then what has been your experience. You know given the fact that none of those applications are being adjudicated upon because of, you know the backlog. What have you seen in the market as the Department. Have seen an increase of illegal operators or what  
5 has been your observation as a result of, you know this issue?

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay, the first thing you see of course is an increase of illegal operations. The second thing is the issuing of illegal licenses. We experience a problem in the Kuruman-area of someone selling illegal operating licenses. The third thing is violence. People are getting aggravated at taxi ranks, because all  
10 these vehicles coming and there is definitely more violence at taxi ranks, more violence at Malls, because of everyone wants a piece of public transport and they see it as an income. Buy a vehicle and you start to operate and that is really a problem and I can foresee in the future taxi war in the Northern Cape, because of us not stick to the 90 day period.

**MR NGOBENI:** And just to understand. Could this also be the reason why when we read SANTACO's submissions? One of the issues that they raise is that they are not being given an opportunity to present when operating licenses are being conceded. When those applications are being conceded could that be the reason that from where they are sitting they are thinking that PRE is  
20 considering applications and therefore they are not being given an opportunity, but on the other hand what is actually happening is that, because of the moratorium none of these applications are being considered. Hence they are not getting or hence they are not seeing any publications in the Government Gazette for them to be able to respond and then make presentation before the  
25 PRE.

**MS OLIVIER:** The Act said if there is no objection against an application it is not necessary to have an open board hearing. The PRE can go ahead and they can issue an operating license. The PRE did fault. There was a fault in their way of adjudicate. They did refuse some of these applications. They did appeal  
5 against the decision of the PRE. The Transport Appeal Tribunal did refer it back to the operating license, to the PRE to re-adjudicate on those refused applications. So, I agree with SANTACO that they need to have open hearings. Where they can also get a chance to present their case in front of the PRE, because what the PRE does is when they get the planning authority that said  
10 the routes are over saturated. They refuse all of them. They do not look at each one. If they see Kimberley they refuse. So, I support SANTACO in this one, that the PRE must rather has the open hearings and the hearings that the PRE, because of the problem currently in the office of the funds. What they have done are the transfers between mother to a son or a father to a daughter. They  
15 did approve without advertising, just to get the business running, to keep it running and to ensure an income for a household. If the PRE – maybe if SANTACO see that as adjudicating without gazetting. I do not know, but the PRE did do some - intervene just that the business can go on on the ground floor. On the ground if that case happened with a transfer.

20 **MR NGOBENI:** Okay and one of the issues raised is, you know the issue around the issuing of operating licenses to operators who are not aligned to associations. In other words, you know these are operators who are applying but they do not have a letter of support from various associations. I understand you to be saying that and please correct me if I am wrong. That it is not a  
25 requirement here given the exorbitant – given that one of the reasons is

because of the exorbitant. You know amounts that are requested by associations in order for on to obtain that letter of support. If you can just comment on that, because the complaint from the industry is that the PRE is issuing operating licenses without having. You know received a letter of support from various associations is that linked to one of the reasons that you have mentioned in your slide the question of the charging of the exorbitant amounts in order to secure a letter of support.

**MS OLIVIER:** I can maybe firstly pick you for an example what have happened here in the Northern Cape. We approved six operators, minibus taxi operators, on a route of Kimberley Taxi Association, KTA. They do - like there were like violence every day. They took us to court. They took us to the Hawks. They took us to public prosecution. They took us to every possible body in the government. After that six we discussed they KTA took them in and after that the PRE does not allow any application without a letter of association of presented by the Chairperson of the association. We do not allow non-members now application. When an application is approved, you have to come or collect it from the association. You have to apply for membership. We cannot regulate the amount they but we do not issue a licence without a letter from an association

**MR NGOBENI:** Okay and on, I think on slide 9. You then indicate that the reasons for objection. Sorry, not for – Ja, for objections and I am more interested in the planning authorities. What kind of reasons are advanced? We understand from the industry, the minibus taxi industry that you have raised that question of sometimes applications being adjudicated without a letter of

support, but I am more interested in what the planning authorities would raise as an objection before a license is granted.

**MS OLIVIER**: Sorry, I just missed that one. You said the planning authorities?

**MR NGOBENI**: I am more interested on the reasons advanced by the planning  
5 authorities in objecting . If you know.

**MS OLIVIER**: The planning ...[intervenes]

**CHAIRPERSON**: If I may clarify ....

**MS OLIVIER**: Ja, just, sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON**: In one of your slide it is not this one. You indicated that the  
10 bulk of the objections emanate from taxi associations and planning authorities.  
So the question is: In relation to objection emanating planning authorities. What  
are the main reasons advanced by the planning authorities in objecting to  
operating licenses.

**MS OLIVIER**: Sorry ...[intervenes]

15 **MR NGOBENI**: And sorry Chair. It is slide 10. Slide 10. I had incorrectly  
referred to it as slide 9. It is on slide 10. Your slide 10.

**MS OLIVIER**: The planning authorities, you remember, the Act says when you  
apply you must send your refer to the planning authorities. Now, the objections  
we receive back from the planning authorities mostly taxi ranks. They do not  
20 have space for any new taxis at a taxi rank. They said the routes are over  
saturated. ...[indistinct] we did question some of these routes are over  
saturated. You know, all towns are – there are new suburbs, there is new

development, but when a planning authority indicated they not have space for any new taxi at the taxi rank. We cannot agree – cannot approve a new application, because our taxi rank 5 O'clock in the afternoon, the whole road down you cannot in Bultfontein there is a lot of taxis standing outside the taxi  
5 tank. So, mostly taxi rank no space.

**MR NGOBENI:** Thank you and the South African network of women in transport and SANTACO. They have raised an issue with us in terms of the – because their province is very big and the complaint there is sometimes for one to obtain an operating license they have to travel 800 kilometres to get to  
10 Kimberly, for an example, and give an example about. You know those that are travelling from Springbok and the amount of time that it takes for them, you know to be – you know to travel to Kimberley in order for them to obtain operating licenses and that is a complaint that they raise. The question that I have, for the Department, is: Has the Department considered opening a  
15 satellite office in areas closer to where these operators are operating in order to alleviate, you know the time that they have to travel in order for them to obtain operating licenses.

**CHAIRPERSON:** It is, just for the record. It is SANTACO that raised that issue ...[intervenes]

20 **MR NGOBENI:** And the South African Network of Women in Transport, as well  
Chair.

**MALE SPEAKER:** O, ...[ndistinct] let us talk here.

**MR NGOBENI:** No, that is fine.

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay. I can gladly say that we have decided, this year, that two rural offices will be, sub-offices will be open in Kuruman, Mtibi Stad area as well as in Upington. So, Upington is more local and people from Springbok will have only travel that 350 kilometers to Upington. The offices will be open by  
5 September, October the latest transport month.

**MR NGOBENI:** Thank you Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON:** *Ja.* Mr Lesofe?

**MR LESOFE:** Thank you Chair. I would like us to focus on the subsidy contract system. Perhaps as a starting point. Are you aware of any bus  
10 operator that runs unsubsidised commuter bus services?

**MS OLIVIER:** Yes, there are commuter – there are bus operators here in the Northern Cape operate unsubsidised. Mr Motswana between Phillipstown and De Aar. Now, he operate without subsidise. Mr van Wyk has several busses. We only subsidise two or four busses of him and he has also – No, there are  
15 small bus operators that operate that did not – we do not subsidise.

**MR LESOFE:** And do you know if they compete with subsidised commuter operators on some of the routes?

**MS OLIVIER:** No, they do not compete the operations. I am not 100% sure but in Springbok, I think there is a bus company that operates on the bus - *Ja*, in  
20 Springbok between Nabebeep and Springbok, Mr van Wyk is subsidised. Mr Bezuidenhout is not subsidised on that route. So there is competition there.

**MR LESOFE:** And jut in terms of the current subsidy contracts. Were these contracts all awarded in 2007, when the system started?

**CHAIRPERSON:** You mean 1997?

**MR LESOFE:** I beg your pardon. 1997. Thank you Chair.

**MS OLIVIER:** The only – No, the only - the two when it started was Mega Bus  
ad Phumatra. The others are – was all of them are on a month-to-month  
5 currently. A month-to-month basis, except the SANTACO one between  
Kimberley and Ritchie. I was a five year or a three year contract, but the Mega  
bus and Phumatra are from the start and they are on a month-to-month basis  
currently.

**MR LESOFE:** And the other four. When were the other four awarded?

10 **MS OLIVIER:** The other four, the Rainbow one started in 2013, it is a five year  
contract. The Van Wyk's Bus Services is 2014, 2013, sorry. Van Wyk's Busses  
and then the other one Imvusa Trading is the name I did not remember earlier.  
That one started in 2015.

**MR LESOFE:** Okay and if you could just briefly take us through the process  
15 that was followed when the 2013 and 2015 contracts were awarded.

**MS OLIVIER:** It was the 2015 it was a negotiated contracts. I think you all  
followed the court case on TV about Mr Jonkers and that was that court case  
on that route from Nabebeep to Springbok. So that was negotiated contracts.

**MR LESOFE:** Could you just elaborate on that. What do you mean when you  
20 say it was a negotiated contract?

**MS OLIVIER:** Ja, it was negotiated. They were travelling. They were  
delivering a service on that route. The only that was not – it was a new service  
with Imvusa Trading. The contract end of – the one of Springbok and Carstens

Bus Services end and then the contract was given to a new lady in Imvusa Trading and Ms Carstens did not get the contract again.

**MR LESOFE**: Were this contracts the ...[intervenes]

**MS OLIVIER**: 2015

5 **MR LESOFE**: 2015 contract. Were this contract advertised?

**MS OLIVIER**: No, it was not.

**MR LESOFE**: And were bidders invited to bid? And what criteria was used in selecting the specific bus operators...

**MS OLIVIER**: Okay.

10 **MR LESOFE**: Who were appointed in terms of this contracts.

**MS OLIVIER**: No it was not advertised. What happen I – the only thing – Okay, if Women Empowerment they did assist Miss, the lady from Imvusa Trading and she got the contract. Like I said. She was current – she was busy with staff services on that route, but she did not operate with the bus services  
15 and to Empower, Women Empowerment in that area decided that she could – they nego – they - I cannot say negotiate because she was not operate in that group. But empowerment and she got the contract. It was not advertised. It was not advertised.

**MR LESOFE**: And this – is it Imusa.

20 **MS OLIVIER**: Imvusa Trading. *Ja*.

**MR LESOFE**: Imvusa Trading.

**MS OLIVIER**: *Ja*.

**MR LESOFE**: So, Invusa Trading was already servicing.

**MS OLIVIER**: Staff services. *Ja*. She was ...

**MR LESOFE**: Staff servicing a route.

**MS OLIVIER**: It is staff service. She was operating with the staff service and  
5 she – the Department decided to empower a woman in that area and she got  
the contract.

**MR LESOFE**: Is that – is the contract for staff services or for general ...

**MS OLIVIER**: General public...

**MR LESOFE**: Commuter ...

10 **MS OLIVIER**: General public commuters.

**MR LESOFE**: Public Transportation.

**MS OLIVIER**: Mmh.

**MR LESOFE**: And which routes are being service Invusa Trading?

**MS OLIVIER**: Invusa Trading currently operate between Okiep and  
15 Nabebeep; Okiep – Nabebeep – Springbok and Concordia. She is doing that  
routes or the bus company.

**MR LESOFE**: Thank you Chair. Just for the record. So, none of the recent  
contracts were awarded through a tender process?

**MS OLIVIER**: Yes, none of them. They did not go through the tender process.

20 **MR LESOFE**: Okay, thank you and how does the Department monitor  
performance and compliance with the terms of the contracts. How do you

monitor compliance. So how do you, for instance monitor whether operators. You know stick or follow the schedule of timetable.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Maybe just before you answer. The monitoring question. I just want to go back to the previous question. Can you by – which was posed  
5 by Mr Lesofe. Can you explain why this contracts – the reasons why this contracts never underwent a tender process?

**MS OLIVIER:** Unfortunately I am not in a position to answer that question. We just received that – we have just - like I said the office just HOD indicated to us that the contracts was for these people. So, I am not in a position to answer  
10 that question, but I can assist with the monitoring process. We have an external monitor TAS, they are currently monitor two bus companies, Phumatra in Hartswater-area and the one in Kuruman-area and the other four bus contractors are internal monitors. The person will go out on monthly basis meet with them and we have also EPWP volunteers in certain areas that will on a daily basis  
15 monitor the cleaners of the buses if they comply also and then monthly they will send us their travelling schedule. We have their travelling certificates that we can see the number of kilometres they travelled. So we are also monitor them on that, as some of the busses also have tracking devices and we are getting printouts from the tracking companies.

20 **MR LESOFE:** And are there any consequences that flow from non-compliance with the terms of the contract, for instance are there any penalties that are imposed?

**MS OLIVIER:** *Ja.* If a bus is 30 minutes late then that trip is free. We do not pay for it. If the bus are not clean. There is a lot of penalties or broken we are not paying for that specific route or per kilometre for that day.

**MR LESOFE:** And, so in other provinces the subsidy contract system has been  
5 criticised for not being responsive adequately or not responding adequately to the needs of commuters, including, you know travelling patterns. In other words because the system has not been updated for so many years – operators still use – operate on the basis of the original schedules. So, just be – based on that there has been that criticism that, you know the system does not adequately  
10 cater for the changing needs of commuters. Could you comment based on your experiences in the Northern Cape.

**CHAIRPERSON:** If I may just add to that question. The South African Network of Women in Transport, in the Northern Cape, has also raised a similar issue about the time schedules of bus operators not being flexible. Which are so  
15 ...[indistinct] the schedule is not responsive to commuter needs.

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay, what we have done now in the last two years. We have appointed a transport economist and he is busy to an integrated public transport network, an IRPTN. They are busy with the IRPTNs in the Picks Licker[?] semi-area. They have also started in the Kuruman-area with the Mega Bus Service.  
20 Some of the routes that were not anymore active or dead-routes. We call it dead-routes kilometres. They have also changes. So they are busy on a – not on a daily basis, but they are busy to investigate the current contracts to see if they can maybe group some of te routes. If they can expand some of the routes, but they are in te process.

**MR LESOFE**: Would you, but would you accept that as a fair criticism?

**MS OLIVIER**: Yes.

**MR LESOFE**: Okay. Another criticism that has been levelled against the subsidy system is that its disadvantages – small operators, largely because, for  
5 instance for the two contracts that you mentioned that started with the system. Those have been awarded to similar operators for a very long time and the fact that the contracts have not been put out on tender. Essentially that creates a barrier for small operators. Would you comment on that, please?

**MS OLIVIER**: The fact that we did not went out on tender for a process or  
10 because I could not get the question clear. If you can just repeat the question, please?

**MR LESOFE**: So, one of the concerns of the concerns with the subsidy system, right. Is that for a very long time you have had similar operators being awarded contracts. When the system was introduced the idea was that from  
15 time-to-time there would be a competitive tender process which would allow even small and medium size operators an opportunity to participate and you know be part of the commuter bus service. Now, given that, you know as you mentioned. The contracts have been extended in perpetuity. Now the criticism is that this creates a barrier or it serves as a barrier for small and medium sized  
20 operators in other words operators are denied the opportunity to participate in the market, largely because contracts are renewed in perpetuity and there has not been any – there has not been any tender process at least for 23 years now.

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay I agree that small bus operators does not benefit from the fact that we do not go out on tender. I agree with that, but the problem also, I think the reason why we are also going out on tender, currently, is the amount that we are currently paid per kilometre is maybe not so – it may be lower than  
5 you expect. Sol a big bus company like Mega Bus maybe can handle that amount currently, bur to bring in a small bus operator, this is now my opinion. To bring in a small bus operator to operate on the current fares we are given per kilometre. They will not survive. They will not survive, because of the amount and then secondly I am, I think the peak – the grant we get also the  
10 Northern Cape is the lowest of all nine provinces because of the number of people in a province. So, but what we have done – maybe I can also explain to you. What we have done with the Kuruman contract is the Mega Bus. We did request that they must sub-contract a certain amount presentation of their contract with a small bus operator. So, we did try skills transferring in some  
15 ways, but I agree that the fact that we do not go out on tender the small operators cannot apply.

**MR LESOFE:** And what was Mega Bus's response or reaction to your proposal?

**MS OLIVIER:** They are currently subcontract a certain amount presentation of  
20 their contract are a sub-contract with a sub-contractor. We did inform them previously, there was – maybe I can explain. There was a previous in 2014, there was case that we would take some of the routes from Mega Bus to give to another operator and that ends up in a court case and at the moment it is back at the - that operators does not operate anymore. So the routes are back with

Mega Bus, that is also a reason why they have their attorneys. We did try in Kuruman to try to give some of the routes to smaller operators. But ...[intervenes]

**MR LESOFE**: Sorry, just before you proceed. That Kuruman incident when did that occur?

5 **MS OLIVIER**: 2014/15

**MR LESOFE**: 2014/15?

**MS OLIVIER**: 2015. *Ja*.

**MR LESOFE**: And you were taken to court by Mega Bus?

**MS OLIVIER**: By Mega Bus. *Ja*. Mr Gouws they did take us at the attorneys.

10 They were in court and the routes are back with them now.

**MR LESOFE**: And is it because of a settlement or because of a Court Ruling.

**MS OLIVIER**: I think it is to do with, I am not 100% sure. So, I rather not answer, but I can just confirm that the routes are back with Mega Bus. I am not sure what the legal process was about that.

15 **MR LESOFE**: Okay and in terms of a commuter experiences. Have you received any complaints from commuters regarding the services that are offered by subsidised or the contracted operators?

**MS OLIVIER**: The question. Did we receive complaints from commuters...

**MR LESOFE**: Yes.

20 **MS OLIVIER**: On...

**MR LESOFE**: On services.

**MS OLIVIER:** On services? Yes, we did receive, remember like for example in Springbok. We receive complaints. We subsidised the route, but a person does not drop his tickets or in Ritchie the busses – we receive a lot of complaints, but we are dealing with it on merits and we are investigate all the complaints we  
5 received.

**MR LESOFE:** My last question would have been: How do you deal with such complaints.

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay, I can make an example of the Ritchie – Kimberley complaints that we received. We currently have a transport forum in that area.  
10 So, what we normally is they meet in our office, Mr Modise will regular meetings with them. If any new complaint is coming up. There will be meetings on a monthly basis they also meet in Springbok. So they have some structures in place. I also know our Regional Liaison Officers that is to do with safety, not with transport in that areas will also monitor the situation and if something is – if  
15 there some conflict we will deal with it. We will investigate. We will meet. We will see how we can sort the problems.

**MR LESOFE:** Thank you Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Panel members.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Yes. I just have a follow-up question just for clarity, on the  
20 subsidised busses. So, in 1997, did you have any subsidised busses?

**MS OLIVIER:** In 1997?

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Yes.

**MS OLIVIER:** I must speak when did they start the Department. Yes, Mega Bus and Phumatra.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Okay. So, Mega Bus is the only bus service that was company ...[indistinct] subsidies since 1997.

5 **MS OLIVIER:** Since 1997. Yes. Mega Bus and Phumatra. I think Phumatra's name was at that time – there was another name, but Phumatra was part of them. I know about the two. *Ja*.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Okay. So, the four bus services came in from 2013 to 2014 and 2015. So, this current subsidised busses, are they raising any concern  
10 regarding the amount that you are paying them.

**MS OLIVIER:** Yes. The Ritchie – Kimberley, like I said to the SANTACO Group. They could not afford the busses. So they are not – they are operating again it is a loss, because this Free State Company are taking the whole payment a month and they only pay them a certain amount. So, they are  
15 complaining. The other complaints we received from them, not just for kilometre but is also when they are like ...[indistinct] about is there is deductions when they did not comply. So they also – it is sometimes difficult for a small bus operator to have a standby bus, like Mega Bus have a lot of busses and if there is not a standby bus and my bus broke and I am not there in  
20 30 minutes. I must operate but I cannot – I must get someone else to operate in my place and that cost extra money. So, there are certain problems there.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Then in terms of, I think you raised the issue of funding for publishing in the Government Gazette, in the National Government Gazette and I think you mentioned R3 000,00 and we understand the application fee is

around R300,00 for an operating license. So, what do you think about the suggestion that: Says maybe the application fee is the one that is supposed to be raised to R3 000,00. Do you think, you know commuters are – you know operators are able to pay that kind of money?

5 **MS OLIVIER:** I think if we raise then what will happen is the smaller taxi operator will not be able to afford that amount. It is just the operators with six, seven or eight vehicle that already establish in the province. That will also in the one – in the one hand it will stop the increasing of applications received daily, on the other hand it will - it is only a certain group of people that will be  
10 entered the public transport industry and we see it in the Northern Cape the public transport as a way of - means of earning money, breadwinners will start a business. So we will – if we increase it to R3 000,00. We will stop the incoming applications but we will stop also job opportunities for some of the people here from the Northern Cape.

15 **MR MANDIRIZA:** Are there any current plans for empowerment. I think you mentioned that one of the bus operators that was doing staff transport ...[no sound]

**CHAIRPERSON:** And the mikes went ... O ...[not translated]

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Okay are there any other empowerment plans to empower  
20 any other upcoming bus operators.

**MS OLIVIER:** We are always looking at empowerment and especially for the women in the transport industry, but I think also if we go out on tender for subsidised contracts, we will definitely – certain points will go to woman operators but at current stage no.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Thank you Chair.

**NO SOUND AT** [1:18:02:4]

**MS NONTOMBANA:** The question I have is with regards to the – just the nature of the province in terms of the different modes of transport. The submissions we heard was that some people have to travel long distances and I just want to get a sense – which mode or which modes of the transport currently services commuters the most. So, given the, what is it? The distances that people have to travel. Are they mostly using buses? Are they mostly using taxis? Are they mostly using something else?

10 **MS OLIVIER:** ...[no audible response]

**MS NONTOMBANA:** Just in general for the province. Do you have a sense?

**MS OLIVIER:** Sorry, if I understand correctly. You just want to know in general what mode we currently the most applications?

**MS NONTOMBANA:** I am saying. Which mode of transport do people in the province use the most, given the distances that they have to travel?

**MS OLIVIER:** Okay. The mode of transport they are currently using is minibus – is taxis.

**MS NONTOMBANA:** Is taxis?

**MS OLIVIER:** *Ja*, because busses – there is no really long distance busses running in the Northern Cape Province.

**MS NONTOMBANA:** And then on the bus contracts. How did you determine the routes that would be sub-contracted when you are saying that you tried to

have Mega Bus sub-contracting to the smaller operators. How did you determine which routes would be sub-contracted?

**MS OLIVIER:** What we do is, like I said. We are doing an integrated public transport road network plan and we indicate all the routes and we ...[indistinct]  
5 the routes. So, when we said to Mega Bus they must at least 20% sub-contracted. Then we indicate some of the routes that mostly – that will definitely make - that the person can make a living of that 20%, but we costed the routes.  
*Ja.*

**CHAIRPERSON:** Ja, thank you very much Ms Olivier, for your time and for  
10 your presentation. We really appreciate it. You are excused.

**MS OLIVIER:** Thank you very much it was very hard but thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you. We will now take a presentation from the South African Network of Women in Transport. Can you please come to the stage. O,  
we will then take a five minute adjournment and we will be back after five  
15 minutes.

## Session 2

**CHAIRPERSON:** Welcome back, we will now receive a presentation from the South African Network of Women in Transport in the Northern Cape. Thank you very much for coming madam. Thank you for your time as well. There should be  
5 a piece of paper in front of you. You may take the oath or the affirmation.

**MS. MABANGA:** Okay. Good morning everyone. My name is Kearebetswe Mabanga, the Provincial Chairperson of the South African Network of Women in Transport in the Northern Cape. I hereby swear that the evidence that I shall give shall be the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help me God.

10 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, is it Ms. Mabanga?

**MS. MABANGA:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you. Your colleague can do likewise.

**MS. SMITH:** Good day. My name is Elizabeth Smith from Port Nolloth (sp) and from SANWIT. I swear that the evidence that I shall give shall be the whole truth  
15 and nothing but the truth so help me God.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Ms. Smith

**MS. MARTIN:** Good day. My name is Moria Martin; I am from Kimberley. I swear that the evidence that I shall give shall be the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help me God.

20 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Ms. Martin, I understand that you have prepared a presentation. You may take us through your presentations. Yes, you can go ahead.

**MS. MABANGA:** Okay, thank you very much. I chose to start my presentation in this way just to give an overview of SANWIT and how far we are right now, where it all started. On the 31<sup>st</sup> of October 2008, the Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment which is the BBBEE charter was launched at the  
5 National department of Transport by the Former Minister of Transport, Mr. Jeff Radebe. The BBBEE charter will change the face of transport in ensuring that the sector sticks to the government's aims. It will help to spread the country's wealth. Now, the South African Network of Women in Transport which is SANWIT was established. This umbrella body was established as a strategic  
10 vehicle to engage business and government on issues that impact women in the transport sector including entrepreneurship. Dedicated Department of Transport Unit focused on the promotion and management of the BBBEE charter in SANWIT. The integrated and related sub-sector of the BBBEE charter development by the Department of Transport emphasizes that the key  
15 empowerment challenges, low-levels of black ownership, the inadequate presentation of black women with a workforce and low-levels of skills of employees. Now, the transport sector, the BBBEE charter council approved by the cabinet in November 2014 implemented monitor evaluate progress of the BBBEE charter in the – it is actually supposed to be 4 because we group them.  
20 It is 8 sub-sectors of the transport, but we group them; it's only 5 now which is the aviation sector, domestic and foreign, the public transport, the rail sector, road and freight and maritime sector.

Now, SANWIT was formed in 2005 and by 2007 the organization has defined its constitution. It was born out of a need to break the existing barriers for entry into  
25 the sector and demystifying the existing myths. SANWIT was launched in the

Northern Cape province in 2009. The target focus is to target all women entrepreneurs and aspiring in the transport throughout South Africa. The aim is to strengthen the role of women in transport. It was handed over to the Department of Transport Safety and Liaison in 2010. Now, the vision of  
5 SANWIT is to champion and articulate the aspirations and social economic development of women in transport. The mission is to facilitate and promote opportunities to support, empower, connect and grow women in transport businesses. The core objectives is to encourage women to enter and succeed  
10 in the transport industry through facilitating enterprise development, networking and supporting women for success and growth, negotiating on behalf of members for wealth generation, lobbying and advocacy for policy environment that will support and enable the sustainability of women enterprise.

The 2015 Women in Transport summit that was held at Birchwood in Johannesburg, there the then Minister of Transport Mrs. Dipuo Peters  
15 reaffirmed the need to remind ourselves where we come from. She also affirmed the responsibility to encourage women to enter and succeed in the transport industry. Now, the objective of the summit was galvanizing the role of women within the transport sector, to recognize the achievements of women in the transport sector, to gain insight and solutions to expedite women  
20 empowerment and transformation within the transport sector. Now, the deliberations in this summit was tasked to result in the concrete plans of the participation of women in the projects and to improve the representation of women at senior levels in all areas of transport sector.

Now, the future of SANWIT, way forward for women emancipation. The  
25 resolutions that were taken are clear. Advancing the radical economic

transformation, emancipation of women, youth, people with disabilities through set aside projects, developing a 5-year programme for action which will be used as a monitoring tool. On the promotion and strengthening of SANWIT as an umbrella body for other women formations within the industry. Now, the public transport purpose, I picked only the public transport elaborated on all the transport sectors, but for this presentation I only chose the public transport. The purpose was to ensure the provision and regulation of safe, secure, reliable, cost-effective and sustainable public transport services in South Africa through legislation, policy and strategies.

10 Now, the current opportunities. Implementation of integrated public transport networks, opportunities in contracts, stations, depot management. Participation in scholar transport contracts through provincial education and/or transport departments, opportunities presented by the National Land Transport Act of Section 41 to negotiate public transport contracts and therefore push the transformation imperative as part of these negotiations. The public transport industry has to transform women must participate in decision-making structures. The department has also developed a cooperative model aimed at assisting micro and owner operator type of businesses to assist with the mechanisms that will enable accessibility to big public transport contracts.

20 Now, the gaps that were identified. The participation in down-streaming public transport industries is a few retails, spare parts and tyre companies, vehicle repairs funding constraints in public transport leading to delays in industry transformation, procurement of legislation and regulations set aside. Low numbers of women taxi and bus owners, public transport services are still dominated by men. In the taxi sector, the transfer for operating licences from a

deceased spouse to the surviving widow has proven to be a lengthy process. Now, the list that I was given that we needed to attend to, number 1 is the licencing, routes allocation and entity regulation in operating licences, moratoriums in operating licences route allocations. Now, in the province as a whole as the Provincial Chairperson, I am responsible for all the 5 districts which is the Namaqua district, the Big [inaudible] district, the JTG, the Uppington JZFM and then the Francis Baard. Now, when I got this request, I spoke to all the coordinators in the different districts because what triggered this I was told it was going to be on all. So, I didn't want to come and sit here and speculate because it will not bring out the real issues. So, hence I asked the 2 ladies to sit with me because I said to them if it needs be that we must produce the proof of what we are talking about, they must be able to present it because here I am only attending to the topics in general. But if it needs be that they need to answer some of the things, they can come in. Thank you.

15 The 1<sup>st</sup> topic, what we are picking up is the there are still challenges in the operating permits applications. The delays due to the moratorium and the backlog which is still a problem because applications dating back to 2011 are still outstanding and no communication in this fact. We apply, but later told the system rejected your application that was approved by the same system and nothing is done about it. The members complain that they are rejected on routes that other players are operating on and told that they must join the taxi association as the routes belong to the taxi associations. Now, the encounter with the PRE because remember when these complaints come in as a Chairperson and the committee we have to go and see what we can do. So, we went to the department, we spoke to the PRE and it was clear that SANWIT

does not have routes. That's the response that we got from the PRE. SANWIT doesn't have routes. So, if SANWIT wants to apply for permits, they must join the taxi associations. Now, there is also another challenge were Namaqua district, it's very far. The distance is +/- 1300km where members have to travel

5 to Kimberly just to apply for permits and it is costly for them because it is transport and accommodation and on top of this, they have to pay for it. Now, one of the members complained that even for temporary permits which only cost R50, they have to travel this far and the cost incurred are more than what they are even paying for the temporary permit itself. So, it is a challenge that

10 they are sitting with. Now, they also recommend that can't there be a satellite office in all the districts where members will be able to access these offices easily be able to obtain what they are looking for because it will make things easier for them. Okay, the 2<sup>nd</sup> point is price regulations and price setting mechanism for all modes of transport. Now, SANWIT is not involved or invited

15 to be part of these discussions on which they are directly affected as they also operate in these sectors. To create adequate women representatives on discussions and debate on trade, that impact transport it will assist if SANWIT can be a part of it. Now also SANWIT lobby for the adequate women representation in all transport structures and businesses both owned by the

20 government and private sector. The prices are set by the associations according to the distance and the cost of fuel. And as a body SANWIT association we are not really playing a part in that.

Now, the allocation of operational subsidies and its impact on the competition inter and intra competition. Now, regarding the subsidies inter and intra model

25 are not easily accessible because currently PRASA told SANWIT at the

conference at Orlando that they do not have the opportunities in the Northern Cape province which is still a challenge for us because we can see that there are buses running around. So, we are questioning ourselves, how come we cannot be part of this. We want to be part of the rail transport even as  
5 shareholders. The availability of subsidies for women in these sector, it must be prioritized.

Now, the transport planning challenges in the implementation of integrated transport rapid transport networks. The advocacy and recognition, voices of women are not sufficiently heard when decisions are made that affect them.  
10 There are not sufficient platforms, mechanisms and processes where women can effectively engage policy makers. Now, the broadening, deepening and strengthening – in order to broaden and strengthen women voices we need to make sure that when women are represented, they are represented across various areas, level and stages to develop and capacitate a number of women  
15 that will represent and be voices of women and democracy to deliver for women. Their voices must be heard on policy and regulations. Regulatory issues that affect them at the local, region and increasingly globally. We are aware of the transport stakeholders' meetings where the integrated transport plans are discussed and finalized by the municipality and transport modes and  
20 local and districts, but we are not part of it. So, it would really assist if SANWIT can be able to and a part of it.

Now, in terms of the transformation in the public transport assessment, women in this case need advocacy champions where there are none at senior levels. Existing advocacy platforms are weak and need to be strengthened. Women  
25 are not sufficiently represented in relevant government and state-owned

enterprises. The capacity and political will to mainstream women's economic empowerment at senior levels of government is insufficient and women's voices need to be heard in both private and public forums and at most senior levels of government. There should be flexible terms implemented by government in terms of impounded and repossessed taxis. Now, in terms of the transformation here, I would say there were legislatures passed and at the summit it was discussed but nothing was done, like for example the Minister said women must have a stake of 36% in the taxi industry, but that never happened because you will find that the males will transfer their permits to their wives in order to make up for that 36% for the routes and when we apply for the routes those permits you will be told that the industry is already saturated. So, in terms of transformation it is very difficult for us. I didn't have time to go through my presentation, I am sorry about t. And I didn't have time to actually sit and do it myself. I hope it makes an impact.

The impact in the BRT implementation on the renewal of taxi operating licences. Well, you know in terms of the BRT I am sure it is very clear the for us in the Northern Cape it is actually a challenge. We don't have buses, the Rea Vaya and the likes. For us as women with feel that there is a need for them because our province is vast even though the population is small. We have areas around Kimberly, you don't travel easily to those places. You have to wait for a taxi that is going to take long and if there was a bus, at least it can take a lot of people and it will have times it will travel. Then people will know at such time I have to be at such place in order to reach there. But they are struggling, people have to take hikes in order to reach places where they want to. Especially, some of them when they want to do their shopping they are coming to Kimberly. So,

here there is really a need for the Rea Vaya buses, that is what we feel as women and we want to take part in this sector. Now, the access to finance in the taxi operators, this one there really are challenges. We are struggling to get finance, only the taxi finance can assist, but the interest is very high at 28%.

5 Now, the services – women services faces barriers and prejudices even though they have better credit payment records. Excess to credit becomes a challenge especially new entrants into this industry because for SANWIT we are not only dealing with already established businesses, we are also welcoming people who are envisaging to do business in transport. And especially for women, it

10 has been a challenge because the transport sector was male dominated for years. So, as women coming into this industry, it's really a challenge. So, we are trying to break the barriers, but it is not an easy thing. I think excess to finance for us, it works with private sector's financial institutions if only they can remove the barriers to access funding and to encourage further outreach to

15 negotiate women business funding. They must be a bit lenient when it comes to funding women. Now, the gender budget analysis you know in negotiating, ensuring allocating for women business support from various government institutions especially the NEFC. Now, access to infrastructure and terminal facilities. The sustainability and access to business support – women have

20 specific needs and barriers that require specific interventions. Mentoring and coaching support from transport associations to enter into this sector. According to research also, and the complaints from the members especially in the remote areas like the Namaquas, they are sitting with a situation where there are no taxi ranks. So, they are exposed to thugs robbing them, they are exposed to

25 bad weathers and there is also a problem whereby the roads are not tarred,

there are gravel roads. It's like maintenance for their transport is very high. They are also sitting with a situation whereby there is no flexible times for these bus operators. People are struggling that side and you know for us to be sitting with a situation where we are told that the routes belong to the taxi association, 5 is a challenge because we can step into that space and try to close the gap.

Now, contracting relating to bus operators long-term contracts which have not been subjected to competition bidding to the long-term. The bus operators have been operating on a month to month basis and it has been for years with the same licences. As women, we are interested in bus subsidies which must still 10 go on tender for long-term contracts. The competition on bidding is a challenge because the current bus owners have more knowledge on the tendering processes and experience which is a disadvantage to women. Now, the commuters' experience, the waiting time costs of public transport, walking distance to public transport facilities. I am sure I have already covered it in the 15 previous topic. Now, here the members feel that the assistant drivers and the marshalls, they must be trained on customer care and it is also a challenge for commuters to board a taxi they will go around looking for customers while they are getting late for work. The cost of transport is the same for different distances and increasing, it's crippling their budget. A struggle to get a taxi when they 20 knock off late becomes of the times of operations. That is what we could compile in the short notice that we were given. I hope I have captured everything and I hope this will actually help the women in the transport sectors to actually take part and also excel in the transport sector, industry actually. By saying that I would like to thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Ms. Mabanga. Ms. Smith and Ms. Martin, anything that you wish to add or any points of emphasis. Please switch on the mic as you do so. Yes, you may, just give an opportunity to interpret what you are saying, but you can go ahead. Is there a mic for the interpreter? I think it is  
5 fine, you can interpret whilst you are seated down. Please give an opportunity for the interpretation.

**MS. MARTIN:** Thank you very much. I applied in 2009 for a long distance licence from the Department of Transport. I sat at the board with the Chairperson Mr. Kia Mabanga, Mr. Steven Jonkoos (sp) was the HOD at that  
10 stage. After a while I have waited some time and they didn't come back to me. So, I asked them what happened to the permit I applied for. I went back to the department and then they told me that my application was deactivated and the reason is that it was refused. I asked them what the reason was and they said that I should apply again. I went back last year and I applied last year and as  
15 Mrs. Olivia said that there was no long distance licences from Kimberly to Springbok, Port Nolloth. Yesterday I went back to the department and I asked them when will the government gazette be published again, the publication now of this government gazette. It's not out yet. Then I went to Mr. Aaron, I saw him he was the head of the Licence Department. He said I should go to the  
20 association for long-distance permits and I should pay an extra amount of R150 000 which was just exorbitant. I was not able to pay that. I went to my Chairperson and I discussed the matter with her. During the year, I went down to my hometown Springbok and I see the taxi association Mr. Buiken who is the head of SANTACO. I went and discussed this with him, he couldn't  
25 understand that I travelled all the way from Kimberly to see him as I do stay in

Kimberly. I just want to make a correction, Mr. Buuiken is the secretary of the association. during the year, I think it was about 2 months ago, he came to Kimberly and I went with him and we saw Mr. Aaron. We discussed my long-distance gazette with him, he promised that the government gazette will be out.

5 It is 2 months later and nothing has happened yet. I am still waiting for my permit. There was a group opened on Facebook for long-distance lifts, people that want to ride together for long distance. I am still waiting for feedback for my permit. I have to go and open accounts again because my banks accounts have all been stopped. Thank you very much.

10 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Ms. Martin, Ms. Smith, anything that you would like to add?

**MS. SMITH:** Thank you very much. As a SANWIT member, I was very proud to be announced the best entrepreneur, but sadly my vehicles was repossessed. The reason for this, besides the public transport, I also do the learner transport and the department never paid me from 2015 January till 2015  
15 December. I still wait for that money, I fight, I plea, I cry, I everything. But till today I was never paid. I was on my way to the office to go and sit there till they closed the office and try to sleep there begging for them to give me my money. For the 5 vehicles that I have, I used to have a 54-seater bus, 22-seater, 3 15-  
20 seaters. I only have the 54-seater bus and Mercedes Benz in a 15-seater. The others were repossessed because the government doesn't pay me. I am very sad, I was very proud to win the award of the best entrepreneur woman. I am very sad because this business I start in 2013 with the help of the Lord without no money from the government, nothing. But sadly now, it seems as my  
25 business has to go bankrupt. Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Ms. Smith, Mr. Ngobeni.

**MR. NGOBENI:** Thank you Chair. Just on the presentation you made this morning, you have identified gaps in your presentation. The 1<sup>st</sup> question that I have is what are the current activities that you currently engaged in as SANWIT  
5 to fill those gaps. So, you have identified those gaps there. And one of the participation in the down-stream and you know in public transport industries you have mentioned all of those thing. So, what I am more interested in finding out is what are the activities that SANWIT is currently engaged with to you know fill in those gaps. And as a follow-up to that question whether or not any of those  
10 activities that you are engaging in are bearing any fruit?

**MS. MABANGA:** Thank you sir for your question which is very fair I think. You know, the truth of the matter is yes, we visited, we wrote letters to all state-owned entities, to private businesses and pointing out to them because we have a document in place for the declaration that was made. So, we felt that it was  
15 necessary for them to know what the Minister agreed upon and what it is that they are supposed to do for us even with the Department of Transport, we went them. We had a meeting with the HOM, HOD and the MEC trying to show them the relationship that we need to have and how we need to fill these gaps because we cannot do it alone. We are a stakeholder of the department of  
20 transport and we feel as a department of transport, as we discussed because I am sitting on the National Council, most of the time we sit with the Deputy Minister Mrs. Sindisiwe Chikunga. She was saying, the only people to actually facilitate and make sure that we have a platform and make our voices known is the department in our provinces where they can call these state-owned entities  
25 to the table so that we can present ourselves. And then from there on, we can

walk the road by ourselves as long as the introduction is done. But since we have been waiting, I don't want to point fingers at anyone. At the moment, we are having a relationship with the department, we are getting somewhere because currently we are having back to back meetings to try and make sure  
5 the we try and fill these gaps. Now, we didn't just sit back as an association to say this is not happening. We wrote letters to those entities, we went around delivering the letter. Some of them called us in, we had meetings with them. And currently I can tell you that, yes, we are running on our own even though we don't have the funds to do that. We run from our pockets, we don't have an  
10 office, we run from the boots of our car. But we are knocking on those doors to say this is the situation, this is who we are and this is what you should do for us. So, I don't know if I have answered your question sir.

**MR. NGOBENI:** Thank you, and one of the most important issue that you raised is you know the question that voices of women area restrictions not  
15 sufficiently being heard and very importantly so; you then indicate that your engagements with policymakers could be better so they can better engage with women in transport. The question that I have is we know that currently the department is currently working on a subsidy policy Nationally. So, they are trying to review the subsidy policy which only focuses on specific modes of  
20 transport and it does not necessarily focus on all modes of transport. And they are currently working on that. So, the question that I have is whether your organization with its relationship with government, the minimal relationship with government that you currently have; whether you are engaged with government in trying to make your voices heard and to try and infrastructure the current  
25 policy that government is trying to come up with in order to make sure that the

industry is subsidized. So, there is that work that currently the government is working on. So, the question is whether or not you are involved and if you are not involved and if you were not aware then I also want to bring to your attention that there is that work that government is doing and you know, you can also  
5 make your voices heard in that forum as well. But maybe just to get your comments if you have heard any engagements with government in trying to get your voices heard in the drafting of the current policy that government is trying to put for the entire industry.

**MS. MABANGA:** Thank you, sir. I actually know that in all organizations or  
10 rather also like any association there is protocol. So, as a member of the National Council, we have an executive. So, at the moment we don't know up until the council meeting is called. So, I believe that because we are working closely with the Deputy Minister, I believe that the executive committee is probably part of that, they know about it. But for us as a National Council to  
15 know, we are going to be called to a meeting because we are having quarterly meetings or special meetings if need be depending on the urgency of the issues on the table then they will call us to inform us about that. Because it is at National, currently it hasn't come to provinces I want to believe. So, sometimes we will know what is happening, but when it comes to the provinces, there is a  
20 door that is blocking us to get that. So, for instance I would mention to you now that I know about the integrated transport meetings that are sitting at the municipality. I went there because I wanted to be part of them because I believe we need to know what is happening in our town also as women especially in the transport sector. We need to be part of that. So, I went to SALGA which is the  
25 body that is working with the municipalities. So, they welcomed us and they

introduced us to the Mayors and the councillors of the province so that we can work hand in hand with them and be part of that Commission. We haven't yet been invited to one, but SALGA made it their business to call us in so that we introduce ourselves as SANWIT to all the Mayors and Councillors. For instance, 5 the reason why I wanted to present later was I was supposed to be at the meeting because the Mayor at Francis Baard called on all the business formations secretaries and Chairpersons because there are some things that we need to discuss on what is happening in our surrounding. So, I couldn't attend that because I wanted to make sure the they know we are here when 10 they are sitting in those policymaking meetings. We need to be a part of it especially as women in the transport sector. We cannot allow them to make decisions on our behalf and yet we didn't make an input on it. They need to hear it from our side as to what is actually more comfortable for us. Thank you.

**MR. NGOBENI:** And lastly from me, the organization was launched in the 15 Northern Cape in 2009, and you indicated in your presentation this morning that this organization was born out of trying to break existing barriers in the sector. Having been launched in 2009 in this province, have you done some review in the province to see whether you are making any progress in terms of what you are seeking to achieve in terms of breaking the barriers and trying to various 20 sectors that you have identified specifically in this province.

**MS. MABANGA:** Yes, we were launched in 2009 and then in 2010 we were handed over to the Department of Transport Safety and Licencing because when we were launched, we were with the department of roads and public works. Now, for us to be handed over to the Department of Transport Safety 25 Liaison, the department then organized a conference on our behalf which was

held in Uppington. And there they called in all the state-owned entities, the mines and the likes. Where I am sitting now, I am not sure I am at a point to talk about what we discussed, but I can tell you that we were challenged at that conference and the outcome was not good. Hence, probably you know we remained stagnant and I would say rather dormant because from that conference nothing happened. We had to go back and also, the other challenge why it seemed we were stagnant or rather dormant – we moved from one MEC to another. We are sitting now with a 5<sup>th</sup> MEC and for us it is a challenge because every time we have to go and reintroduce ourselves. So, we are with the 5<sup>th</sup> MEC who is saying yes, I know about you and we are ready to work with you. So, it is a matter of we had to reintroduce ourselves and resubmit the documents. Hence I was saying earlier that as much as we were being challenged in the way, we didn't just sit back to say this is the situation in front of us. Because of the information that I will be carrying from National, I will come back and say, ladies let us not just sit back, let us go out there and knock on the doors. When the department is ready to see us, they will do that because we felt we are being delayed because every time we have to start from scratch. So, I don't know if I answered your question.

**MR. NGOBENI:** Thank you Chair, I have no further questions.

20 **CHAIRPERSON:** Mr. Lesofe.

**MR. LESOFE:** Thank you Chair. Ms. Mabanga, do any of your members provide commuter bus services?

**MS. MABANGA:** No, not that I know of. Sorry, the only ladies that I know who are doing business in the public transport sector are mostly the taxi operators.

Currently, no buses and we want to enter into that space because I remember we had a transport planning session with the former MEC for Transport, Ms. Pauline Williams and at that RTMC was there. So, they were talking about BRT. So, we are very much interested in that. I even stood up and said how do we  
5 enter into that space because we also want to be bus operators. And then the MEC directed us to the PRE which I think the lady spoke to us about earlier. I don't think I will be mentioning names because I don't want it to seem like we are pointing fingers because when I say the PRE I mean, they know who I am talking about. We went to them, we wanted to know more about the buses. So,  
10 are at the stage where we are ready to tender. We are still having discussions with them because they said the tender will be out in no time. So, we were asking them to take us through the tender document because most of the ladies are not really aware or rather skilled or learned to complete the documents. So, it is only fair if we are being trained so that we know what we are getting  
15 ourselves into. Thanks.

**MR. LESOFE:** And if in relation to the tender process, I think you make a very important point in your success that because of knowledge and experience, the current operators are likely to have an advantage if they were to you know also you know if you were to compete for a tender with them. What would you  
20 suggest as a solution to this. In other words, what would you or how would you – what kind of support would you like government to provide to you so as to ensure that empowerment is indeed realized. And maybe when responding to that question, you may touch on the kind of model that government should use or adopt when it issues tenders. So, for instance would you have capacity to  
25 handle a complete contract maybe that requires you to service a certain number

of routes, that requires you to have X number of infrastructure or buses. Maybe taking that into account, what kind of a model would work for you?

**MS. MABANGA:** Okay, thank you for that question. You know what, I actually like what you have just asked because we raised that at the Council when we  
5 had a meeting with the Deputy Minister and she was saying to us that remember you ladies were fighting for 50-50. So, for us to achieve that, we know that the industry that we are at transport, has been male dominated and we said we want to enter into this space and nothing is going to stop us. Now with the challenges that we are faced with and the barriers that we are faced  
10 with, we agreed with the Minister to say because of the skill and the experience that you correctly mentioned that most of the ladies don't have especially in this industry. We agreed that we should be given the training number 1. Number 2, the already established male dominated businesses must take us by hand, they must impart the skill, they must monitor us and the government must ensure  
15 that they partner us with the right people because at some point we want to reach the standard where we can be able to do this on our own. But at the present juncture, I will say to you, we won't be able to handle a fleet – oh, sorry. At the present moment I know that as women and as individual businesses we won't be able to handle a fleet, but I believe as a cooperative we can share the  
20 skill, the experience and some of them are more experienced and skilled than others. And also with and already with established business we will be ready to do this. So, we are saying nothing is difficult for women. We have been running this business with our male counterparts but sitting at the back. So, it is time now that we take up that space and do it ourselves. Thank you.

**MR. LESOFE:** Thank you Mr. Lesofe, panel members? Thank you very much Ms. Mabanga and Ms. Smith and Ms. Martin for your time as well as for your presentation. We will certainly take up the issues that you have raised this morning with the relevant stakeholders including the provincial department of transport as well as the National Department of Transport. We will certainly do that. Thank you very much. We will now take a short tea break and we will be back at 12:00 to receive a success from 2 SANTACO regions which is the Namaqua and the Francis Baard region. So, we will be back at 12:00 and tea is being on the room next door. So, everyone is welcome to join us for tea.

10

### Session 3

**CHAIRPERSON:** We will now resume with the hearing. At this stage we will receive a submission from the SANTACO regions, which are based here in the Northern Cape. Welcome lady and gentlemen. Thank you very much for  
5 coming. There should be a piece of paper in front of you. You may take the oath or the affirmation. Starting with, let's start with the lady. Please switch on your mic as you take the oath or the affirmation.

**MS WITKOEI:** I, Sylvia Joan Witkoei, swear that the evidence I shall give shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God.

10 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much. I didn't get your surname.

**MS WITKOEI:** Witkoei.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Ms Witkoei. Maybe, let's go to your colleague on your left.

**MR RIFLES:** I, Jack Barend Rifles, swear that the evidence that I shall give  
15 shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much.

**MR MOFANA:** I, Moses Mothlate Mofana, swear that the evidence that I shall give shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me  
God.

20 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much. If you could start by introducing yourselves as well as the associations that you represent and then you can take us through your submission or presentation.

**MS WITKOEI:** I, Sylvia Joan Witbooi, represent SANTACO, Namaqua Regional Association.

**MR RIFLES:** I, Jack Barend Rifles, represent Kimberley Local Transport Association. I thank you.

5 **MR MOFANA:** I, Moses Mofana, represent Kimberley Local Transport Association, who are members of SANTACO. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you. I am not sure who will start, but you may take us through your presentation.

**MR MOFANA:** Okay, the lady will start.

10 **CHAIRPERSON:** Please switch on the mic.

**MS WITKOEI:** As I have introduced myself, Sylvia Joan Witkoei, from the Namaqua region. Presentation on challenges in Namaqua district. The background. The district consists out of six municipal areas, namely: Richtersveld, Nama Khoi, Kamiesberg, die Hantam, die Karoo, Hoogland – it is  
15 somewhere here in the, next to the western Cape and the Kaima – it is here on the N14. Yah.

Fast, distance and gravel road, characterise the district in which our members render transport services to the majority of communities. Road transports are the mainly mode of transport provide. Challenges experienced within the  
20 district – poor infrastructure, the condition of roads – both tar and gravel roads are not on standard and cause in many cases damages to vehicles or in some instances poor access to road results in communities not being served as should be, etcetera, along the Orange River. Goodhouse is one of the places.

The satellite office of the district. In the absence of transport operations office in the district. It becomes very costly for our members to drive to Kimberley in the northern Cape province, which is 800 kilometres from Springbok.

Our capital for the Namaqua district. To access services of the department transport, safety and liaison. Services such as replacement of vehicles, renewal of operating licences and receive of temporary operating licences, when the need arise are but a few amongst others. Our plea is to use the district office of department transport, safety and liaison as a satellite office to render services to our members. In various cases, the department does not take the matter – excuse me – we, as the association rise the matter with the department and it seems that the department does not take the matter serious.

Issuing of operating licences. The long waiting period for process to be conducted hamper effective services delivery to communities. Members and operators are waiting between three months and three years for permits. Communicating to application lack, with the result that operators do not know when their applications are dealt with or they don't get the opportunity to present to Operating Licence Board the importance of their application for an operating licence.

Government Gazette. Issuing operating licence to non-members become problematic as those operators use the already over-saturated routes of the existing operators, which cause conflicts amongst operators. Only proof of the association's letter of support should gave operators access to operating licence in order for us to co-ordinate the industry in a district level. The implementation of the National Transport Act of 2009, with amendments will

assist with the local municipalities regulatory committees will guard against over saturated of routes. They will be able to co-ordinate the amount of public transport on roads in their jurisdiction.

Clean-up of nature(?) system becomes essential. Too many permits and  
5 operating licences are not in use for 180 days and more, which contributes to an over-saturated route. This disadvantage new active operating licences to enter the market and grow the economy.

Application of law enforcement in towns. We experience a problem that anybody want to transport people without an operating licence or suitable  
10 vehicles. Pirates – they compete with legally licenced operators and cause lost of income to our members. Law enforcement are not applied constantly, which gave the impression of selective service, but also inconsistency. Unauthorised transport should be [inaudible 09:06] and if it continues, vehicles should be impound for the cost of the owner. The association should be acknowledged in  
15 road blocks and standbys of authorities to jointly address road safety, where possible.

[inaudible 06:25] for instance – access to public transport subsidise. The Namaqua district consists out of welfare state communities, who are crippled by poverty. Operators cannot render a sustainable service on a daily basis, as our  
20 people are not able to pay the tariff determined. More communities should be subsidised, especially in the deep rural areas, to enable them to get to the towns and better their lives. Transport operators will indirectly benefit from this subsidy and provide a sustainable service to the communities. The routes have

no ranks for passengers, pick up and drop offs. Commuters have to endure bad weather condition while waiting for transport.

I thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON**: Thank you very much Ms Witkoei. Gentlemen?

5 **MR MOFANA**: Thank you ... I don't know whether I should say Chair or [inaudible 10:44] director? First I have to complain – this place is very cold, I am shivering. I wanted to say many things, but because I am shivering I just want to get out now – my taxi is still outside.

The first thing that I want to put on the table is the National Land Transport Act  
10 – doesn't recognise the taxi industry. So, Government wants to out-phase us as a taxi industry, because we have complaint about this subsidy as this kind of commission. They don't want to subsidise us, because I don't know – they say that we are 100% black owned company or industry and they wanted to promote the blacks. But according to what I understand and what I see – they  
15 don't recognise the taxi industry.

They issue permits on the road that are existing, so that we can fight and so that they can discredit us. That is their main objective – we are from the stone-age – from the apartheid Government, it didn't recognise us. Our own Government – this is the fifth president that we have approaching now and we  
20 haven't been recognised. When Government wanted us to transform, they came with the 'Be Legal' campaign and Be Legal is all the illegal operators – it was good for them. And when the World Cup was coming to South Africa, they came up with a new system of transport and they said that subsidy will be part of the package. If you don't recap, you don't get subsidy. We have recapped,

now we have been killed by high instalments, we've been killed by high petrol hikes, we've been killed by low prices, we are being killed by over-saturated routes – our business is dying, because of our own Government.

5 Still on the issue of permits. Permits are being issued at randomly at left and right. Associations are there and the board can issue a permit on a route that is having an existing association and then they send a person to us, telling him to go to the association and acquire a letter from the association. And when the association say to the member that they must pay a certain fee or join fee, then the member will go back to the Government and then the Government says but  
10 you cannot pay that amount of fee, because the route that route belongs to – the permit is the Government's permit, the route belongs to the association. We can issue a permit as to anyone as we wish. If they don't want to recognise you, we will issue you a certificate of a non-member. Now imagine a non-member operating on a rank, where associations belong – how do you control  
15 that member? Unless, it is a recipe of disaster or unless you want those people to fight and kill each other – they discredit us?

When I die – I am still on the issue of the permit – if I die, me, Moses Mothlate Mofana, when I die, my wife will be sent from pillar to post, only to change the permit from my name to her name. My family will be suffering, because by then  
20 the combi will not be able to operate, because she will not be able to release the disc, the licencing disk, because everything is still in my name. She will not be able to change the permit to her name, because everything is still in my name. The kombi will not – the association will not allow the – even the traffic cops, will not allow the car to operate on the route, because it will be illegal.

The man whose permit this is, is a deceased. So, this is the kind of problem [inaudible 15:05].

The other issue – I am not talking out of [inaudible 15:15] – I am talking in Kimberley in particular. Permits have been issued in Kimberley – some at night,  
5 some on Sundays – now you ask yourself, what is going on? Some on holidays – those permits are being issued. When you go to the Board, then the Board tells you that you don't have enough information. You take the information and you take it to The Hawks and you give it to The Hawks and you tell them nobody has been arrested. Now, you don't know – where does the taxi industry  
10 complain?

Hence, I say we are being treated like stepchildren of this Government. We are not being recognised. I don't know is it because our – are we illiterate? Because I want to believe that I am 'what do you call it' the standard that we have reached in the industry, standard 2. Maybe that is the issue that they are  
15 treating us – they are ill-treating us. They ill-treat us very much – you know when I talk about our Government, I don't want to – I feel like going out, because even if - I know my information is falling on deaf ears, but I'll give it to the commission, because the commission want it.

So, I am here Commissioner to give you the information.

20 A about the subsidy – I remember we met Minister S'bu Ndebele and [inaudible 16:49] as the deputy minister by then – you know it is still – I will repeat the incident that we were given by the then Minister, because he was presenting the presentation – he said to us, *we cannot subsidise the taxi industry, because it is disorganised*. How can our own Government say to us we are

disorganised? The people that are supposed to guide us – give us guidance, give us education, give us direction. Discredit us in the public, telling us that we are disorganised. He could have said that we are illiterate – people associate us, they don't left or right is or front or back is – that was the painful answer and

5 I am very disappointed on that kind of insult.

That is the issue that I want to put to you Commissioner is the routes- I know I've been through that document Commissioner, Commissioner I must admit – it is a very good document. It entail, at least it cares for most of the things that we want to present to Government. We are happy for this kind of information – I  
10 don't know who feed you that kind of information, but it said so many things about us, which I think I must credit you for that one.

But, my disappointment comes only when Government doesn't want to give us statutory powers. We want to be self-regulated, because according to the Government SANTACO is representing the taxi industry, but yet SANTACO  
15 cannot reach any association which are [inaudible 18:47] by the Government. Routes are being identified – not by us, but in fact by Government. When walls are being built there, Government decide who will operate there, not us. They can even recruit people, so that they must made application and they even call that place – and you know, I like this word – they will call that place a grey area.  
20 There is a grey area there, nobody is operating there, whereas [inaudible 19:15] they must speak to us as business people.

But the [inaudible 19:21] plan of the [inaudible 19:23] is in particular a black(?) municipality – currently they are planning to build a mall. They haven't yet invited us, but yet they are going on with their plan there where they want to

build a mall and this will be the third mall and there are going to be a third conflict at the next mall, because nobody knows who is going to operate there. We've put these things in front of the MEC last time and we told him *MEC please assist us, because the [inaudible 19:52] does not speak to us.*

5 The municipality in [inaudible 19:56] they are fighting – who is supposed to give authority about the operations of the issuing of operating licence, because according to my understanding they shouldn't issue the permit, but the municipality must in any way give a recommendation as to whether is there a need or not, but currently [inaudible 20:21] only issue permits left and right. The  
10 municipality – when we complained to them, they say *no, we are not part of this Government anymore, because we are fighting with [inaudible 20:31] says that the Act doesn't say anything about the municipality* – I don't know what is happening or if the Government wants to take the taxi industry in particular.

I think Chairperson – you know there are so many things that I wanted to say to  
15 put on the table, but because I must say this one so that you must have it in record. I only got this invite yesterday at 5 and I was supposed to look into it – I am not a lawyer [inaudible 21:07] and come up with a presentation like the lady have done, but me now I look like somebody who is like a taxi operator. Whose brains – whose head is here and his brains is outside. He operate as he  
20 please, but maybe you have listened to me – I don't think I have to waste your time. I know I said I only wanted two minutes, but I have exceeded my two minutes. Thank you for your time chairperson, thank you so much.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, thank you very much.

**MR RIFLES**: Thank you chairperson, I think my colleague covered all that we need to say. The only problem that I encounter is regarding and I see here is the ITP (integrated transport plan), but according to me – I've been engaged with various meetings with various stakeholders – Government and municipality  
5 as well, but when you pose a question that and asking them – who is our town planner, because why I am asking that is in the morning – say rush time to take people to work – we have to queue in a street, that is Curry and Craven Street and that is – the one is a one-way direction and the other is a two-way direction. Now what the drivers actually have done – they stand in front of the other  
10 drivers – the public as whole and complain. The traffic just come and gave you fines over there, but they doesn't see and we have asked them on several in several meetings *please, make space for us*.

The other issue is they gave routes for three associations and they decline for the others and they decline for the other association. That thing is causing  
15 conflict amongst ourselves, but they regard us as illiterate and hooligans, but they drive us to that. If you come with them – they've got several meetings for the previous MEC [inaudible 23:19] and the Government and the Transportation Board as such to no avail.

That is only mouth talk – last year was a come down in Kimberley. We were  
20 stuck – they ain't got a Plan B for us. Our vehicles are being repossessed – as my colleague reiterated – we does not get a subsidy. They go to Free State with the authority of SANTACO and they go and take busses over there. They say we ain't got busses – how could we afford busses. A 65-seater busses is almost 1.5 million to 2 million worth – where else should we get that money if  
25 you have to fork out everything from our own pockets?

And transport I believe is one of the second influential business from the black man's side economically. Now, if Government doesn't give us subsidies, how would we cater with an instalment of plus minus R13000.00 per month and you doesn't make that kind of money? The other thing is that the northern Cape is not expanding. There is an influx of people from other provinces – here is no jobs. All that we depend on – each and everybody is going on pension or is taking a severance package and come into the transport industry. I thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, thank you very much. Mr Ngobeni?

**MR MOFANA:** Mr Ngobeni and chair, please forgive me. I forgot something – the taxi ranks – you cannot locking people to operate to come and support our business, because our business place space is a [inaudible 25:11] space – drugs are being sold at the taxi rank and nobody is saying nothing. When you inform the policeman the policeman about this situation – the next thing the druglord comes to you and say that you think you are clever. So, we are being threatened in our own space – so the people will not support us.

And the other thing that I want to raise is that is the issue about SUNWEED and SANTACO woman's desk. We even got our own woman's desk – where we support our own women that must come with transport and this and that. Government is having SANTACO and SUNWEED on the other hand. We said to Government mix these people, because when you go to conference, we will always have a woman's desk and we will talk to them and we will give them this and we will give them that.

The very same minister will tell them they must buy busses and you must buy this and you must buy this and you must enter the space of merit time and you

must enter into the space of rail and you must – so that we can give you money. And again the minister says – the very same minister [inaudible 26:13] stands again up in the media *son you must come up, we will give you busses, we will give you* – no, this is conflict of interest.

5 We are a forming a structure this side about women and on the other side they are forming this structure about women. This is conflict of interest – women are going to fight one day over something that is not there, because these things that they lead them to is the very same sentiment that the industry have been going through. Thank you, that was my submission.

10 **MR NGOBENI:** Thank you chair. Just one question from me – the question of the letter of support that you have mentioned Ms Witkoei in your submissions this morning – just to try and understand, we heard this morning from the Department they and if I understood them very well, they seem to be suggesting that KTA had taken the matter to Court and they succeeded and that currently  
15 the way that these operating licences are issues is that they no longer issue them without a letter of support from the association. Is that what you understand things to be working currently at the Department at the ‘pre’ level?

**MS WITKOEI:** “Ja, ons het by” ... interpreter or is it fine? Baie dankie. Ons het al by verskeie vergaderings, soos ek genoem het in die dingesus genoem dat  
20 ons ‘n 1000 en plus kilos van Kimberley af geleë is en ons het dit ookal onder Departement Transport se aandag gebring vir al die “regions” het “transport safety and liaison” kantore en baie van die kantore opereer in die “regions” – so het die assosiasies gevoel die verskillende “regions” en assosiasie gevoel dat

die “mobile clinic” ag “mobile” kantoor dan na die “regions” toe gaan vir die uitreiking van die lisensie operateurslisensie.

**INTERPRETER:** We feel we have had different meetings and we have mentioned that we are more than a thousand kilometres away from Kimberley.

5 We want the Department to know that we want all the regions to have offices and we know that a lot of them are operative already. The associations felt that the mobile offices should also be able, in the regions, to give out licences.

**MS WITKOEI:** “...en ek wil net dit bysê dat ek het toevallig op Mev Olivier se ‘interview’ op afgekom – sy het toe genoem dat Kuruman, Matiewiestad(?) een  
10 ‘mobile’ kantoor gaan kry en dan Upington, wat dan nou sentraal geleë is vir Namaqua vir die operateurslisensie. Dankie”

**INTERPRETER:** I’ve heard Mrs Olivier’s presentation where she mentioned they there will be offices at Kuruman and Upington, which will be more central.

**MR NGOBENI:** ...and, just a last question from me ... what are the  
15 requirements, what is it that you want from an operator, before you can issue them with an operating licence – sorry, before you can issue them with a letter of support? What is it that they have to do to the association and what are your requirements?

**MS WITKOEI:** “Sal jy net vertaal?”

20 **INTERPRETER:** “Wat is dit wat julle wil hê – wat is die vereistes vir ‘n operateur - wat is dit waaraan hulle moet voldoen voordat julle hulle sal toelaat?”

**MS WITKOEI:** “Ja, om ‘n lid van SANTACO te word, moet jy aansluit in jou “region” waar jy bly – Pixley, Francisbaard, JTG, ZF en dan nou Namaqua. Om ‘n lid te word, moet jy aansluit en daar is ‘n vereiste aan verbonde dat die – die vereistes verskil natuurlik van “region” tot “region”. As jy ‘n lid wil word moet jy  
5 maar net uitvind of daar ‘n assosiasie in daai “region” is en na daai kantoor toe gaan en dan sal jy daar al die inligting kry om ‘n lid te word. Daar is mos nou ‘n “criteria” wat jy moet aan voldoen.

**INTERPRETER:** If you want to become a member, you just join the association – there are different ones Francisbaard, Pixley, ZF, Namaqua – there are  
10 different requirements – you just go there and find out if there is an association in the area – go to the office and find the information you need to become one a member – there are different criteria for different areas.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Would you like to add? Okay, that’s fine.

**MR MOFANA:** I don’t know did I capture the questions - the two questions  
15 correctly. You spoke about the one of KTA, nê?

**MR NGOBENI:** Uhm

**MR MOFANA:** Where they took the council, the municipality, the Board to Court and then they have won the case against the Board. Even though they have won the case against the Board, but the Board couldn’t do nothing,  
20 because the Board was issued. Hence, those people who are incorporated into the existing association – so it means the Board didn’t assist them with anything. Because, to avoid conflict, we spoke to the association – these existing permits they are there, what are we supposed to do with these permits? We came to an agreement – let these people join you, so that they, because

those people were opening up a taxi rank next to Pick n Pay, Pick n Pay in the CBD and then the KT Association is operating at the back – at the back of this mall. They are operating on this side. Now there are two associations on the same route from different ranks. It is a recipe of disaster – definitely they are going to fight. That is how we manage to curb the violence, but we met with the Board, the current MEC of transport – he emphasized and [inaudible 34:25] they emphasised it, they will not issue a permit on an existing route, without the letter of association, to avoid conflict.

On the second one – what is the requirements that you have to have so that you can become a member or becoming an operator on the existing association...

**MR NGOBENI:** ...and maybe to get the letter of support.

**MR MOFANA:** ...letter of support, yah.

**MR NGOBENI:** Yes

**MR MOFANA:** There are two ways – the first one, you can go to the Board and apply and then if the Board (on the first one) grant you the permit, then you can write to us a letter for membership and then we call you in and we sit with you and if we agree, we take you in as a member, because you show us the letter that the permit has been granted. Then we sit with you and then after sitting with you, we come to a conclusion – you pay membership fee and then we grant you the letter.

The other one – before you are – maybe for example you have been operating in the taxi industry as a driver and your uncle wants to buy you a bus (a minibus) – we said to those members or to those drivers *come and we give you*

*a temporary membership* in the first place, we give you a temporary membership and then the association will assist you to acquire a permit. This is the other one – the other way.

But if you don't want that other way – the other one is – if you want to become a member, the other criteria is that you have to have a permit – you have to have a car – you have to have routes on your permit and then we can consider you – that is the other one – the one that we use to operate in the older days. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Mr Lesofe?

10 **MR LESOFE:** Thank you Chair, I just have one question with two legs. I understand that you are from different regions or districts – if you could, so that we can have a sense in terms of the routes and the state of competition. If you could identify some of the main routes, where you compete directly with subsidised commuter busses and the second leg of the question would be the challenges that you encounter on those routes – in the context of competition, the competition that you face from subsidised commuter busses?

**MR MOFANA:** Thank you chair. The challenge that we encounter on a subsidised route is ....

**MR LESOFE:** Perhaps if you can start by identifying the route.

20 **MR MOFANA:** The route ... the route that is currently having a subsidised bus contract, is the route between Richey and Kimberley.

**MR LESOFE:** Okay, and how long is that route?

**MR MOFANA:** It is almost for five to six years.

**MR LESOFE**: No, I mean in terms of the distance?

**MR MOFANA**: The distance is almost 30 kilos.

**MR LESOFE**: Okay.

**MR MOFANA**: 36, if you drive into the township, when you take the N12 in the  
5 direction of Cape Town.

**MR LESOFE**: Okay yeah.

**MR MOFANA**: 30 kilometres out of Kimberley – now the route is called Richey  
Kimberley and the association is called Richey.

**MR LESOFE**: Okay, and which commuter bus do you compete with on that  
10 route?

**MR MOFANA**: Commuter bus?

**MR LESOFE**: Yes

**MR MOFANA**: I don't know their names – it is from the Free State...

**MR LESOFE**: ...or interstate?

15 **MR MOFANA**: Interstate – it is interstate. And there is also some sort of  
conflict there – I have to be honest – you see, I have taken a sworn oath that I  
must speak the truth. Government gave this thing to the – a statement was  
issued by Mr Jonkers and (if I am not wrong) MEC Mabilo – they say they are  
giving this thing to the taxi industry, but the role players in that contract are the  
20 taxi (we don't know the percentage) that he taxi industry SANTACO, provincial,  
the commuters and the taxi association – the affected association – it operates  
in there. The only affected association can only tap into that contract.

The Government issued this thing to Mr Nkonke, who is the chairperson of the province's taxi industry. When they got this thing, he was supposed to call a meeting between themselves and the affected association, but it never materialised. We went back to the MEC and query and he said to us that *you*  
5 *know how the Department is operating – if you want any information, you must write me a letter, requesting the information.* We wrote the letter to the MEC and the HOD – we are having a new MEC and we are having a new HOD – we didn't even receive any information about this contract.

So the people – I will come to your question how does it affect the operators this  
10 side. The people there – last year, they blocked the N12 for this contract, because we as an industry – especially we as [inaudible 41:00], because Richey's infrastructure [inaudible 41:02]. We don't know what is the secret about the contract, so we called the new MEC of transport – by then it was Paulinah Williams – we called Nkonke – he called us in this fashion of kind of  
15 meeting. Nkonke said he will report at the Conference in Upington – we went to Upington and he never reported it.

Then we went back to the MEC and we told him we never got information and he said *now you must take Nkonke to Court*, but we said *but MEC, this is not fair, because our members are being affected by this contract of yours*, because  
20 there is no fair competition. When you go to Richey, people are waiting for the bus – our members doesn't have the thing what you call the 'morning rush', because all the people in that place are waiting for the bus and in the afternoon when they are supposed to have 'afternoon rush', they don't have 'afternoon rush', because the people are still waiting for the busses.

So, the tariffs of the bus is lower than the tariff of the taxi industry. So, it is not fair competition, because the busses are getting subsidy and we don't get subsidy and then we have to compete with them. Thank you.

**MR LESOFE**: Thank you.

5 **CHAIRPERSON**: Panel members?

**LADY PANEL MEMBER**: Just a follow-up on the routes that the taxis operate in – I wanted to find out if there are any routes that are not serviced by taxis, because you said that the conditions of the routes are usually a problem in most of the areas that are serviced? So, are there any areas that are not serviced by  
10 the taxis? Maybe they are serviced by busses only.

**MR MOFANA**: I don't understand the question – come again.

**LADY PANEL MEMBER**: I am saying – in the presentation by Mrs Witkoei – she said that some of the taxi operators operate in gravel roads with very bad conditions – so I wanted to find out if there are any routes where the taxis  
15 cannot operate, because of the bad conditions of the roads or any other reason – where you will find that for example it is only the bus, because it has to be in that route, because maybe it is subsidised. Are there any such routes?

**INTERPRETER**: “Is daar enige roetes wat nie deur julle taxis gediens word nie, as gevolg van die kondisie van die paaie? Jy het vroeër gesê dat die paaie  
20 baie sleg is, so ons wil nou weet is daar dele van die roete wat julle nie diens nie, waar daar slegs gesubsidieerde busse nou ry?”

**MS WITKOEI**: “Dankie. Ja, daar is.” Unfortunately “moet ek nou maar sê, die area wat ek bedien, wat nou bestaan uit Violdsdrif, Goodhouse, Henkries en

dan Port Nolloth, Sundrif – van Port Nolloth af tot Sundrif, Koeboes – daar is nie busse wat gesubsideer word nie, maar ons bedien mos sê nou maar daai busse met onse bussies, wat dan op daai” gravel road “my kollega hieronder se bussie het nou vir die week gestaan met ‘n petroltenk wat stukkend is as gevolg van  
5 daai paaie” gravel roads “in daai omgewing in”.

**INTERPRETER:** Yes, there are some roads – the area that I service Port Nolloth to Sundrif, Violsdrif – there are no subsidised busses servicing those areas. We do that, the roads are terrible – my colleague has a small little bus who is standing with a broken petrol tank.

10 **MALE PANEL MEMBER:** Okay, just one question from my side. The presentation from that department this morning – you spoke a little bit about the membership fees that people have to join and the like – there was a figure that was mentioned as a membership fee and I think of R100000.00 – can you identify with that figure and possibly you can maybe indicate to us you know  
15 whether it costs an existing members in the application process like you have mentioned before?

**MR MOFANA:** What was the amount that the lady mentioned?

**MALE PANEL MEMBER:** Up to a R100000.00

**MR MOFANA:** Okay, Yeah Commissioner and Programme Director, we – that  
20 figure is from long distance. We have queried it, because we are also in the same space as you are in light of the R100000.00 – how does it assist a person, if you have to pay? But, the argument was – they are having what they call and I am not sure about long distance, because I operate locally, but they have a system that they call GLUM – I am not sure what GLUM. Unfortunately

there is no person here who can explain, but they say a GLUM system is a boosting system for you whereby you get a month an opportunity just to operate first car – you just come and load and go – you just come and load and go.

The other explanation when we asked them and queried about this R100000.00  
5 – they said to us they are having a bus that is working for them. They bought it, they themselves before anybody could have assisted them. So, in the bus – the money that the bus acquire or make – every and I don't know how it operates – is it every six months or every twelve months then they would share the money amongst the members – that it was the explanation, but it is under correction – I  
10 am not operating a long distance – I am local [inaudible 48:20]. Our fees are reasonable – we negotiate, we are local operators. Thank you.

**MALE PANEL MEMBER:** Just a follow-up question. So, that amount talks to the long distance operator, but for the local what is the range?

**MR MOFANA:** For locals – ours, we split it. When I die or passed on (the  
15 correct word) my wife or my children pay nothing – it is a free transfer. And then, when you buy it and you are in the association – you are a driver, you buy it – you want to become a member, we charge you a R1000.00. When you are a driver and then somebody boost you and then you get a permit and a car. Now to transfer the permit from my name to her name is R1000.00, but when  
20 you are somebody totally outside from wherever you are (we don't want to discriminate – wherever you are) and you are a new member to the industry – it is R10000.00. That's all – it covers everything – we put you in an insurance scheme and you get all the benefits that everybody is getting if you don't have a permit and if you want a second permit, we will assist you to get a second

permit. If you have a problem when you die we will do all those things for you. We don't touch you – it covers everything like every member who was there before you were there. Thank you.

**MALE PANEL MEMBER:** And there are no further questions chair.

5 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, thank you very much for your time and for your presentation. We will certainly take up the issues that you have raised in your submission with the relevant authorities and we will certainly revert to you, but thank you, thank you very much. To the extent that you wish to supplement or to add to your submission, you are welcome to do so in writing, because this is  
10 an ongoing process, but thank you very much. You are excused.

**MR MOFANA:** Thank you chairperson. Am I invited for lunch?

**CHAIRPERSON:** Yeah, we will now take the lunch adjournment and we will come back at 2 o'clock. You are welcome – everybody who is here to join us for lunch – I think lunch will be served at half past one.

15

## Session 4

**CHAIRPERSON:** Welcome back, we will now receive a submission from the South African National Small Bus Operators Council based here in the Northern Cape. Afternoon gentlemen and welcome to the enquiry and thank you very  
5 much for your time. There should be a piece of paper in front of you. You may take the oath or the affirmation. Please switch on the mic as you do so.

**MR MARTIN:** My name is [Moinga] Frank Martin. I solemnly swear that the evidence that I shall give shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God.

10 **CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you Mr Martin.

**MR MATIBA:** My name is Sabata Matiba. I solemnly affirm that evidence that I shall give, shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing else but the truth.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Mr Matiba.

15 **MR DOUGMORE:** I Kenneth Charles Dougmore, swear that the evidence that I shall give, shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Mr Dougmore. I am not sure who is going to start, but if the person who is going to start, can begin by just briefly explaining what their current role is within the organisation and how long have  
20 they held that role and then you can then take us through your submission?

**MR MARTIN:** Thank you Chair, I am the Acting Secretary for South African Small Bus Operators Council in the Northern Cape. The position that I have taken, 6 months ago and as such, should I start with my presentation?

**CHAIRPERSON:** You are welcome Mr Martin to go through your presentation.

**MR MARTIN:** Thank you. Since the establishment of the South African National Small Bus Operators Council, we had a very slow or no progress with the Department of Transport Safety and Liaison in the Northern Cape. We  
5 managed to draw up a memorandum of understanding between the Department and SANSBOK, but to-date, it is, non-functional and it never was. Even during our elective conference that we had, we did not get any help from the Department of Transport Safety and Liaison Northern Cape.

The Department doesn't recognise us, the Department of Education and the  
10 Department of Transport, meetings are held with small associations regarding the scholar transport and we are never invited nor consulted as we also participate in this whole thing of transport. This also resulted in conflict between these 2 different associations. To our surprise, the Department of Transport and the Department of Education, recognises those associations that they  
15 currently take into cognisance.

Due to our passiveness caused by the abovementioned, our members see the council which is SANSBOK as a toothless dog and thus, most of them has resigned and are not participating as they are supposed to be because the organisation doesn't do any good to them.

20 When it comes to these allocations which sometimes we get from the Department of Transport, there is an arrangement that states that gravel roads where service providers operate, will get certain percentages due to the conditions of the road as compared to the one of people who are operating on tarred roads, because obviously the [inaudible] tyres for the person operating on

a gravel road, will be much higher than that one who is operating on tarred road.

So the price regulations, there are no proper regulations of the above. We have a serious problem when it comes to increment from the Department as agreed  
5 when we entered into this particular contract that we are presently serving with the Department of Education.

I want to let the Commission understand that it so happened that in 2012, we were migrated from the Department of Education over to the Department of Transport and this year in April, we re-migrated to education due to some  
10 certain dissatisfaction that the Department of Education was having towards the manner in which the Department of Transport Safety and Liaison in the Northern Cape is handling this issue of smaller transport scholar transport within the province.

Then I want the Commission to also understand that the time when we were  
15 granted the present tender that we are having of 5 years which will be ending next year 2019, it was surprising to us, that where we agreed upon on the tender, the 5 year period that we are having with the Department of Transport, we were just called in as service providers to come and sign documents which we haven't gone through in order to read for ourselves what the document  
20 consists of – what the contents of the documents were, whereby as they stated it from the Department of Transport, was as if it was a negotiated contract whereby there were no inputs whatsoever that we as service providers through that particular department, DOT, Safety and Liaison Northern Cape, we didn't do and we raised that issue in April this year when we migrated back to

education, that the present contract that we are having with the Department of Transport, which was initially from the Department of Education over to Transport, were in no way negotiated by us as service providers with the particular departments and when it came about that we were having challenges  
5 as business people, the Department that we are with presently, when we raised the issues of our tariffs as in the contract which we have seen after we have already started operating, there was a 4.5% increase that was supposed to be getting into the contract every year within those 5 years that we had, but that never materialised.

10 We made it a point to make communication with the relevant officials of the Department of Transport to sit down around the table in order to negotiate this thing, to talk about these things and discuss them and come to an amicable solution towards the problems that we are having.

To name a few, we met with the Deputy Director of Transport, Mrs Connie  
15 Olivier, I think it was around about in March. It was in March yes when we were from the consultative conference of SANSBOK in Kempton Park on the 22<sup>nd</sup> and the 23<sup>rd</sup> of February, whereby within that particular consultative conference that SANSBOK was having nationally, there were issues that we raised and there were resolutions that were taken by the conference in regard to the  
20 manner in which the different provinces are dealing with the service providers in particular the learner transport.

Together with the subsidised route which within that particular consultative conference that we had, SANSBOK came up with resolutions that departments, provincially, should look at when they give over contracts to these big

companies which come from – some of them are out of our province into our province, they should take into cognisance that we demand as SANSBOK, that we should get 51% from those sub-contracting that we would be getting from these big companies.

5 Then after we have met with the official, the Deputy Director of Transport, as I have alluded to before, we agreed that she will make it a point that we meet with the Director of Operations within that particular department for it was a very serious letter to us for you don't see any progress in regard to SANSBOK as a body which is the legitimate whereby you see parallel structures being  
10 recognised more than we are, but in that, Ms Olivier failed us from the Department of Transport, to arrange a meeting for us with the Director which is Mr Mguza. Then we initiated a meeting ourselves with the Director of Operations, Department of Transport.

When we met with him from SANBOK, he promised us that he would try by all  
15 means, to bring everybody on board which is the Department of Transport, the Department of Education together with Treasury, because the main contention within the issue, was about the 4.5% increase that was supposed to be added into the contract that we had with them. Now no one of them wanted to take responsibility. Now that I have mentioned to the Commission that we migrated  
20 back to Education, from DOT, we felt it to be appropriate for us to meet with the Department of Education, Department of Transport, with Treasury in order that everyone should be able to air out his views and not to be able to point fingers at the other one because we are all under one roof.

Up to today, as we are sitting in this Commission, we haven't yet been able to meet with those 3 departments which is Education, Transport and Treasury. We ended up writing a letter directly to the MEC for we should understand there is the thing that they call protocol we cannot jump over and go to the MEC, but it  
5 was in vain.

So we are sitting here waiting to meet with the MEC so that we can be able to air our views and discuss this thing with him so that this thing must be resolved and we should be able to go on in our daily business and people must have courage towards the people that they have elected, because at the end of the  
10 day, if they see that there is nothing that is going on, then we say they have elected people and those people don't bring any help to them, doesn't change their lives. That is what people would say at the end of the day.

Programme Director, the issue of allocation of subsidised routes, subsidised routes are not negotiable. The Department gives you what they want despite  
15 different challenges. Transformation in the public transport routes are in the hands of big transport companies which we have mentioned here, e.g. the [inaudible] buses of this world and the Inter States of this world and even the one day event contract is also given to them, whereby we are simply saying if you can remember I think it was in June, there was the national army expo here  
20 in Kimberly, we were surprised as SANSBOK as small operators within the province to see buses coming, big buses coming from other provinces like the Free State, the Inter States operating here, whereby the partakers of that particular function, were the very kids that we are transporting that we are giving learner transport to.

You can imagine how vast this province is Programme Director. Kids were taken as far as Namaqualand Springbok to come to Kimberly. Some were taken from the [inaudible] or from all the 5 regions that were heading here from Francis Baai. Now you ask yourself a question, is it logic for those organisers to  
5 take buses from Free State to come and transport people from Namaqualand to Kimberly, whereas they could have taken the service providers who are there in Namaqualand to give that particular service.

I mean it's economically, [inaudible] that the budget constraints compared to a person who is in that particular area and the one that you take from outside will  
10 differ, but that is what we are seeing and we failed to raise up these things as officials. We are unable to meet with them in order to [inaudible] forwards the challenges that we are having. We are trying everything which the law or the Act requires from us which will enable us to meet the criteria that we are supposed to meet in regards to the social responsibilities that we are having.

15 We have done everything as SANSBOK in regard to the strategic manner in which we want to run our business and the manner in which our social responsibilities are going to be towards the community that we render services to. As much as we know in our communities that we have got people who we should take care of like the youth, like women, like disabled people, where we  
20 have sent documents as SANSBOK which are indicating or stipulating clearly, what are our intentions in regard to the service that we render and the social responsibility that we are going to plough back into our communities.

Lastly, Programme Director, access to infrastructure and terminal facilities, it is only for taxis and buses. We both use bus stops which were named for buses

and it becomes a problem of parking especially where buses are operating. I thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Mr Martin. Mr Matiba and Mr Dougmore, is there anything that you would like to add or to emphasise or to  
5 amplify in the presentation?

**MR MATIBA:** Yes, my addition based on this presentation, is that you know SANSBOK was initiated by the National Department of Transport and it was ways and means to empower upcoming operators which were known as previously disadvantaged and really we supported that and we did everything in  
10 our power, we attended every meeting and we gave feedback to the provinces, but the major problem we experience, is that we know there are [inaudible] meetings annually, but it seems that there is a communication breakdown somewhere because the MEC or the HOD or whoever, they distance themselves from this organisation.

15 We complained to our national structure and Department of Transport to say, what more can we do, we are having an MOU with the Department of Transport provincially, but they do not seriously honour it, they either violate it. As our Acting Secretary has said, we have done everything in our power to make sure that at the end of the day, what we are having from National, we give over to the  
20 Department of Transport at provincial level, because why? At many times, they were called, they were given emails to attend some meetings at our national structure, including the Department of Transport at national, but I can't remember them attending the kind of meeting and I can't remember even one of them being disciplined for that.

So this is an issue which I think it has to be given serious, serious attention, because at present, we can look at Kimberly. The majority of companies have closed and presently, even the mines have closed. Now Blacks were trying to do whatever possible to put a piece of bread on the table, not only for him  
5 alone, because what is important here, is whenever you are an operator, you become accountable also for your driver, for whatever can happen with your driver, but now the problem here is, for how many years have we been negotiating with our drivers to say, there is no increase, you can't move, we can't do a thing. That is almost 5 years and we changed drivers I don't know  
10 like what because they feel that they are not paid and the other issue, was when operators started on the routes given by the Department of Transport, their buses were in good condition, but due to the road conditions, operators started to experience a lot of problems and what was then happening, it was then a chess play.

15 You know there was [inaudible] saying if you can't do your work, then we will remove you and take the other one, but they know exactly what is the cause of this because there was no increment and we tried to meet with these people, but they never – even if you meet with them, they will never come to the decision agreed upon collectively.

20 So up until now, we come from our meeting, we have implemented whatsoever and I am sure, I don't know, but I just hope that the Department of Transport at provincial level, will just start to agree on what we have agreed upon at national level, because the problem we are also experiencing is what? The type of format which they apply on the payment, it's a bad, bad one. Why I call it a bad  
25 one, is because if you travel for example 100 kilometres, maybe 50 in and 50

out, they pay you for the 50 kilometres. What about the other 50? Because we experience a lot of wear and tear there, so I don't know. As my Acting Secretary has said, we are having these structures which we are negotiating also with the Department of Transport and similarly there is an agreement  
5 between, maybe Mr Dougmore can explain better to you all, but the point is, having a lot of associations and whatsoever, creates a conflict at the end of the day and whereby the Department of Transport national, tried to organise SANSBOK to try and join all these small associations and we were busy with cooperatives, but when we handed our business plan in at national level, we  
10 were told that the money is too much, but never explained how much must it be.

We then submitted our second business plan to the Department of Transport provincially and up until now, nobody responded to us to say alright, we can go as far as this, so actually that was what I was trying to give to the Commission, because really it is disappointing to know that we are having this institution, you  
15 try to talk to them, but they ignore you, they do whatever possible because we experience everything else what is happening and they don't care a damn.

So it is true what you have heard from our presentation and I will leave it just there, thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Mr Matiba, Mr Dougmore?

20 **MR DOUGMORE:** Thank you Mr Chairman, I am going to be fairly short in summing up. I think my partners have given the detail, but I think if we look at what SANSBOK is, it's a small bus operator grouping and it is supposed to benefit it and from our government, the process is to encourage small bus operators to be able to be competitive. Unfortunately that is not happening, we

are not getting help from our government departments, they are not enfranchising us as an organisation they are not enfranchising the small bus operators in their setup.

Unfortunately there is a good amount of corruption that is taking place, but the  
5 end result is, you are sitting with the small operators who are mainly the small Black operators in our country who are still and especially in the Northern Cape, which is a big rural area, that they are still not being able to get involved and earn a decent living from their business.

So after many years and even through our organisation, we are still being  
10 ignored and the people that should be benefiting, are not benefiting, because the big bus companies are still getting their fingers and their feet in the door. I think I will leave it pretty short like that. I think the details have been spelt out by my partners, thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON**: Thank you Mr Dougmore, Mr Lesofe?

15 **MR LESOFE**: Thank you Chair, my first question is just to get a sense of how long has SANSBOK been in existence?

**MR MARTIN**: Chair SANSBOK has been in existence since 2002. Officially the first conference of SANSBOK was held in 2002 at Beechwood Hotel.

**MR LESOFE**: And how many members does SANSBOK represent?

20 **MR MARTIN**: Provincially, members of SANSBOK are based on – it differs from one document to the other whereby the most populated regions that are having more members, it's Francis Baart, John [Talogetse] and [inaudible]. We are talking over 800 members, thanks.

**MR LESOFE**: And on average, how many buses does each member own?

**MR MARTIN**: According to the constitution of SANSBOK as it has been established, we are talking, a member can be a member of SANSBOK who is having 1 x 35 seater capacity bus, which the number of those buses should be  
5 between 1 and 30, not over 30 and some of – I will make an example of myself, I am owning 3 buses, a 1 x 35 seater, 1 x 60 seater and 1 x 65 seater, which is 3 buses. Some are owning, 3 5 10 15, it differs from one bus to the other, thanks.

**MR LESOFE**: And in terms of the age of your buses, what would you say is the  
10 average age of members' buses?

**MR MARTIN**: What I can explain, is that there are refurbished buses and refurbished buses, we were given almost a period of 5 years because if at all your chassis is old, it becomes a problem wherever you transport, but that is what I can explain coming to refurbished buses, because majority of our  
15 members, can't afford new buses. Two, where they are travelling, a new bus will never last. That is why the majority of them, can only afford refurbished buses.

**MR LESOFE**: Thank you, from your presentation and submission, I draw the inference that you provide the following services and you will correct me where I  
20 am wrong, so your members provide scholar transport services, is that correct?

**MR MARTIN**: Correct.

**MR LESOFE**: You also spoke about subsidies. Do your members, also provide, subsidised commuter bus services?

**MR MARTIN:** Correct so.

**MR LESOFE:** And do any of your members provide unsubsidised commuter bus services?

**MR MARTIN:** Yes we do provide unsubsidised commuter services like during  
5 weekends, funerals and churches will want to go somewhere those are the only ones.

**MR LESOFE:** You don't have scheduled commuter bus services where subsidies are not provided?

**MR MARTIN:** No Sir.

10 **MR LESOFE:** Now if we could go to your submission, so on the first page of your submission, under routes allocation, you make reference to an agreement. You say that there is an agreement that states that gravel road operators will get 21% more of what they get, but this never materialised. Maybe if you could give more, context this is an agreement that was concluded with whom? I am  
15 assuming it is with the Department of Transport?

**MR MARTIN:** Correct.

**MR LESOFE:** When was the agreement concluded?

**MR MARTIN:** Well that appears on the contract, it is stipulated on the contract and I signed it almost in 2014.

20 **MR LESOFE:** Okay and if maybe you could just give context in terms of the circumstances that led to the conclusion of the agreement?

**MR MARTIN**: Actually that was already stipulated in the contract, the time I signed it because majority of operators were running away from that route and the day I was called in to assist, I assisted and then they requested that I should maybe sign a contract for 5 years, but I then came up also with part of my  
5 conditions to say, that the routes are bad. I drew sort of an operational plan, how both of us can handle this, because from my side alone, it becomes so difficult because we are experiencing a serious problem coming to breakdowns and what they paid was peanuts. So I could not match the demands of the operation with what they are paying me, so I went back to them and they  
10 understood and I even told them that I had meetings with my entire centre to say what type of tyres should we use on the particular route because new tyres do not last at all and they said I should use steel tyres and these steel tyres, if you buy 6 of them, it was almost nearly R2000 and if I had to spend R22 000 on this bus, with what will I remain?

15 I even explained to them that our diesel distributors refused to take diesel out there, because they were complaining about the road and I also explained to them that you know, when I have to take diesel by myself over to that particular point, I have to hire a trailer. Some guys later refused to give us trailers because they felt that on the return, there is always – I never walk on their  
20 trailers you understand and the other issue was, I told them that the school which we transport, refuses to give our drivers toilets during the day. The drivers have to go to the veld whereby there are toilets in the school and the places they found for us, where our drivers can sleep because those are not drivers residing there, they stay in Kimberly. There is one where there is also no  
25 toilet.

Now you know we have seen those snakes, we have seen everything. If a driver has to be bitten by a snake, who is going to take that particular responsibility? I tried to mention everything, but everybody ignored exactly what I was trying to say. So we are operating at risk.

5 **MR LESOFE**: Thank you and this agreement, does it relate exclusively to scholar bus services, or it also includes commuter bus services?

**MR MARTIN**: Well what I am talking about presently, is about the scholar transport. It is not about commuters and all that, because they are farms and they are deep, they are far away from wherever, even if they have to buy food,  
10 they have to use my bus to travel because there is nothing taking place there.

**MR LESOFE**: Okay thank you and you also in the submission, mentioned that subsidies are not negotiable. Just for the record, in this regard, are you referring – which subsidies are you referring to in this regard?

**MR MARTIN**: Chair the subsidy that we are referring, it's like – there is a route,  
15 a scheduled route between [Richie] and Kimberly which was contracted to [Pumatra] Bus Services and the contract ended. As small operators, as SANSBOK, when that contract was coming to an end, we thought we have been looked at as bus operators to be fitted in there, but instead, taxis were or some [inaudible] was given that particular route once we were there and what  
20 we realised after it was operated by SANTACO, we saw buses from Free State, Inter State buses coming in, brought in by those particular operators which were out of the province on that particular scheduled route of [Richie] to Kimberly.

We are quite aware Chair, that as we speak presently, the scheduled route of that particular route, it is on a month to month basis, it has not been renewed for

a certain duration, it is on a month to month basis and we were also told by the Department of Transport at our consultative conference, that there will be no new contracts that will be given, since there are budget constraints and what have you there. That is what we understand.

5 We were sitting with the idea that in 2018, this year, this contract of [Pumatra] along the area of Francis Baart together was part of the North West. Francis Baart on that side of the [Vaalharts] which is Bamperstad, Touang in that area which is combined by two provinces, came to an end also and it was extended on a month to month basis as we speak, that particular contract.

10 Now, we are here as SANSBOK sitting as people who need to be empowered or waiting for empowerment to come in whatever way, but when that is supposed to happen, then there are some obstacles that come towards that particular way, thank you.

**MR LESOFE:** Thank you, just as a follow-up to that, so you mentioned earlier  
15 that some of your operators run subsidised commuter services, in other words, subsidised scheduled services. Could you give examples of some of them that are operated by your members, where subsidies are provided?

**MR MARTIN:** The routes that I know of that has been operated by our member,  
it is the one that is operated within Barkley by our chairperson Rainbow Bus  
20 Services, that is a subsidised route and I think the other one it is in Namaqualand, it is also within the Springbok area which was operated before by Clarissa Kaspers who was the secretary of SANSBOK who then left and then it was given over to a certain lady from the Eastern Cape or whatever, thank you.

**MR LESOFE**: And you also mentioned in your submission that most of the lucrative routes, are located or given to bigger companies or operators. Can you give examples of routes that you consider as lucrative?

**MR MARTIN**: The lucrative routes that we are considering, is the one that I  
5 have mentioned in the [inaudible] area together with [Tauo], its scheduled routes which are given to [PUMATRA]. You go to Kuruman which is the [inaudible] area region the Mega Buses are operating lucrative routes there for commuters and workers of the mines. They are mostly based there, those are lucrative routes that people are taking.

10 **MR LESOFE**: Thank you. Now if government were to issue new tenders for some of these routes, what kind of support would you need in order to tender successfully and operate on those routes and to take over some of these routes and operate them without any difficulty?

**MR MARTIN**: Chair we as SANSBOK, have established the cooperatives,  
15 whereby these cooperatives has been established together with a holding company that will do business with SANSBOK, whereby SANSBOK as an entity, is not the profit making body. Now you make use of that holding company together with the cooperatives in each and every region. If I can give you an example, if ever here it's a route that has been given, maybe in  
20 Kuruman, as [inaudible] region of SANSBOK, the operators of SANSBOK within that particular areas and under the holding company of SANSBOK, will be doing business at that particular area, which would ultimately benefit everybody who is a member of SANSBOK because it would be done under the umbrella of that particular body.

Financially, we are aware that there are the SETA's and the other organs of government where you can get money from DTI and you can go and apply for monies and all those things. Those are some of the programmes and planning's that we have as SANSBOK which if we were to move today from the  
5 position of weakness that we are in presently, due to the lack of support that we are getting from provincial government, nationally, the Department of Transport, we were expecting the Department of Transport Safety and Liaison provincially, was supposed to have given space for an office for SANSBOK to operate from within the Department of Transport, where we will be [inaudible] our businesses  
10 there, but that has never happened.

Like in other organisations, I will give you an example, SANTACO as a body, is being looked after by government. They have got their offices they had their [inaudible] which lasted for a certain period that we know of before the World Cup took place here in our country. They re-capitalised and in one way or the  
15 other, I happened to be a member of SANTACO. From those [inaudible] vehicles that SANTACO was [scrabbling] the [scrabbling] company did in turn plough back into SANTACO which made them able to go and buy property for themselves which was owned by SANTACO. You can go all over the provinces, the main provinces of South Africa there is nowhere, where you  
20 cannot find an office of SANTACO.

If you go to Bloemfontein, you will find an office of SANTACO. You come here you will find an office of SANTACO. Come here, you will not find any offices of SANSBOK. Go to Free State, you won't get that. Free State is our sister province, we do meet with these people, sit down and talk our challenges that  
25 we are having, thanks.

**MR LESOFE**: Thank you Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON**: Panel members?

**MR MANDIRIZA**: I just have a few questions, I think I didn't get the number of members SANSBOK has in the Northern Cape and also, the size of your fleet?

5 **MR MARTIN**: The size of the fleet, it depends whatever or how many buses the individual is having, depending on the type of contracts he is having and lastly, what I can remember on the database, besides other outstanding members, it was 177. That was on the database which is with the Department of Transport presently, but we are having those you know who distance themselves to say  
10 no, SANSBOK is not moving, nothing is happening and then they just pull out, but we are having with the Department of Transport – I think maybe I can just count the previous secretary, who is now out, I can count less on the 177 we are having and make it 176.

**MR MANDIRIZA**: Okay.

15 **MR DOUGMORE**: Just to add to your question about the fleet, there is no fleet that SANSBOK has, but the different members have many buses, so if we look at how many buses are available, we are talking over 400 buses that are available, but they belong to individuals, not to SANSBOK.

**MR MANDIRIZA**: Okay thank you, I think that was my question. Then you  
20 mentioned something around the holding company. Can you explain how it is currently structured and how it works?

**MR MARTIN**: The holding company per say, is representing the entire province. Then from the holding company, we have regions, 5 regions which

will be answering towards the holding company provincially. Now when we do our business, business will be done from that holding company, but being meant for that particular region where that particular service maybe is required to be, it will be dealt with, it will be done. I don't know if I have answered you  
5 Sir?

**MR MANDIRIZA:** I am not very clear because I think my understanding of a holding company, is that maybe bus operators or shareholders put in some kind of finance or assets and combine them and have a proper structure, governance structure that will be able to either get – I am not sure, is that how  
10 you are structured?

**MR MARTIN:** Yes since I have mentioned in my presentation that here is a holding company that has been established that will do business for SANSBOK and there will be [inaudible] whereby members of SANSBOK will have to affiliate towards those corporative, or have to become members of corporative  
15 and a board of directors will be elected from that particular corporative and then through our contributions that we become members of corporatives, it is how we will be able to can sustain ourselves when we do our business.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Maybe let me put it simply, does the holding company at the moment, have buses that they own?

20 **MR MARTIN:** No Sir.

**MR MANDIRIZA:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much Mr Matiba and Mr Martin and Mr Dougmore for your time as well as for your submission. We will certainly take up the issues that you have raised, with, the relevant stakeholders, including the

provincial Department of Transport, thank you very much. We have now come to the end of public hearings in the Northern Cape. The next round of hearings will be in the North West province starting from the 25<sup>th</sup> to the 26<sup>th</sup> of July, thank you very much.

5

10